

	DART+ Maynooth Line - MCA Stage 2									
					Ashtown Level Cro	1				
	Parameter		Criteria	Sub-Criteria (Quantitative/ Qualitative)	Option 2	Option 4 & 4a	Option 4 & 4b	Option 6		
		1.1	Construction and Land Cost	Assessment of cost of construction of option, land costs, acquisition costs and temporary works	Some comparative disadvantage over other options Constitution costs are high due to direct impacts on costs and and satisfy rail and most difficult construction regularization. Led doubt bases than option to seal with some lands. The overview of the control of	Some comparable disadvanting over other options  Option 4-14a comprises an offline nead bridge and a pedestrian cycle underbridge in  Antonn The requirement is combined bridge after bootstons results in a cost premium  for this option. Option 4-64 bits algorithment of the options of the option o	Some comparative disadvantage over other options.  Option 444b comprises an effirm read bridge and a pedestrian cycle overhidge in Adhtens The requirement to considural shidge at the bouldings results in a cost premium for the transport of the control of the co	Some comparative advantage over other options.  Construction cost impacts are high date to the high devalent of the overhidge creating the high day, and card that it has devaled on the other of the control of the high some day of the high day of the control of the high some day of the high some days. Options 4+4a and 4+4b and slightly more than Option 2.		
1	Economy	1.2	Long Term Maintenance costs	Steel options vs concrete options for structures and maintaining level crossings versus removing them	Some comparative advantage over other options  Reinforced concrute structures are articipated. These have relatively modest ongoing maintenance costs.	Some comparable disadvantage over other options.  Reinforced concrets shrutures are articipated. These have relatively modest organic manisterance costs in the case of Options 4-4s and 4-46 meleterance costs will effective disable in comparison to other activeness date to the provision of 2 his briggs.  Some comparable disadvantage over other options.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Reinforced conceils shoulters are anticipated. These have neitherly modest copping mellolenance coats in the case of Options 44-46 and 44-40-mellolenance coats will effectived double in comparison to other schemes due to the provision of 2no bridges.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Rainforced concrete shuckares are anticipated. These have relatively modest ongoing maintenance costs.		
		1.3	Traffic Functionality/economic benefit	Benefits to vehicular traffic through reduction in journey time lengths and delays through removal of level crossings. Consideration of potentially longer routes for traffic.	Some comparative advantage over other options improvement in journey times; potential for induced tops; potential to increase congestion at Authorem Roundabout as a result of induced traffic. Negligible repeat on journey datance for up to 450 whiches during peak hours.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Some improvement in journey time, potential for induced trips. Minor improvement in journey distance for apprax 5% of through faillo, negligible impact for approx 5% of through faillo and negative impact for approx 64% of through faillo	Some comparative disadvantage over other options.  Some improvement in journey litre; potential for induced trips. Minor improvement is journey distance for appose 5% of brough traffic, negligible impact for appose 5% of though traffic and negligible impact for appose 5% of though traffic and negligible impact for appose 56% of through traffic.	Some comparative advantage over other options improvement in journey times; potential for induced trips; potential to increase congestion at Ashbown Roundabout as a result of induced traffic. Negligible impact on journey distance for up to 450 vehicles during peak hours.		
		2.1	Transport Integration	Impact on scope for and ease of interchange between modes. Impact on the operation of other transport services both during construction and in operation. New intercruption needs and facilities: Reduced waiking and wait times associated with interchanges. Modal shift figures during construction and operations. Changes to journey times to transport nodes.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Improved interchange between modes, subject to satisfactory access to train station platforms. General reduction in journey times. But services may be impacted as a result of headroom restrictions on the proposed route.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Some comparative advantage over other options  Improved information in purpose subject to satisfactory access to train station platforms. General reduction in journey sires. Bus services oncy be impacted as a result of the proposed diversion along the namow filter fload.	Some comparative objective inspect or depositive or of intrody; seen- Some comparative advantage over other options Improved interchange believen modes, sobject to satisfactory access to train station plotforms. General relaction in journey prima. But services may be impacted as a result of the proposed diversion sking the namon River Road.	Some compressive disadvantage over other other.  Some compressive disadvantage over other other.  Inproved intendings between modes, subject to satisfactory access to train station platform. General reduction in journey times. There may be severance and the construction of the required approach range.		
2	Integration	22	Land Use Integration	Impact on land use strategies and regional and local plans. Assessment of support for land use factors local land use and planning kindness of projects in feeting head and planning head and he in challenging the DART Liberborg and and he in challenging the DART Liberborg and and he in challenging the DART Liberborg and and head	Some a comparation absorbing one other options:  As and section of this spillow is tracked on DOC (DP) lands class to Adultace.  The commander of this spillow is tracked on DOC (DP) lands class to Adultace.  The commander of this spillow road is housed in TDP areas indeed or allowing building to the commander of this spillow road is for the context of this spillow road in the commander of this spillow road is for the context of the context of this spillow road of the context of this spillow road of the context of this spillow road is spillowed or the context of this spillow road is spillowed or the context of this spillow road is not used to be context of the context of this spillow road is not used to be context of the context of this spillow road is not used to be context of the context of this spillow road is not used to be context of the context of this spillow road is not used to be context of the context of this spillow road is not used to be context of the context of the context of this spillow road is not used to be context of the context of this spillow road is not used to be context of the	State comparative discharatings and unitar options.  This region (1964 to 1 lead of the limit being and to 1 "region"). The same point (1964 to 1 lead of the limit being and to 1 "region"). The same being a lead to the lead of the limit being a lead of the lead of the limit being a lead of the	This image of the control of the con	Come comparement desaferancings one other unions.  Diplico E is located extensy within the DCDP man. The system is located on micro area of 20 (Permitty Open Signat Landson Release) associated with micro area of 20 (Permitty Open Signat Landson Release) associated with micro area of 20 (Permitty Open Signat Landson Release) associated with micro language Part Code Signature		
		2.3	Geographical Integration	Impact on improvement of external links. Desire to link various geographical – mostly neutral due to localised nature of the level crossings. Overall electrification scheme would be highly positive.	Dignificant comparative advantage over other options  The existing road creasing is available to read buffle for inso than 50% of time during peak hours. The provision of an unconstrond access will serve to enhance access to preposed residential development not in the nativey. Divinted distance noted \$570m(1.1.d. development noted)	Some comparative disadvantage over other options.  The earling read creating is available to read field for less than 55% of these during peak.  South The greating of an excendered schools will serve be exhibited as prepared residential development morth of the railway, Disard distance roads 2.29m (4.5x diversion roads).	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  The existing road creating is available to road traffic for less than 50% of time during past hours. The provision of an uncontributed access will serve to enhance access to proposed residential development notify of the railway. Devined distance roads 2.2km (4.0 celebration totals)	Some comparative advantage over other options  The soluting road cossing is available to road traffic for less than 50% of time during peak hours. The provision of an excenditived access will serve to enhance access to proposed residential development notify of the railway. Diverted distance used it in This (to develop method).		
		2.4	Other Government Policy	Integration with Government Policy, Smarter Travel, Investment Programmes, rail safety, electrification etc	Comparable to other options  Consistency of the control of the con	Comparable to other options  1-8.1 Develop appropriate and SNA Transport Storing processin including  1-8.1 Develop appropriate and less to service descriptment area;  1-8.3 That there will be no significant increase in rate dispectify for private whiches on radial radial  1-8.3 That there will be no significant increase in rate dispectify for private whiches on radial radial  1-8.3 That there will be no	Comparable to other systems  Leading Co. Comparable to other systems including  Lal Develop appropriate and facility to relicing principals including  Lal Develop appropriate and facility to relicing/prince transp.  Lal Develop appropriate and facility to relicing the systems in radio capacity for private whiches on radial  Lal Develop and principal and principal and appropriate arrangements on decisions working, cycling and public transport	Comparable to other options  wheels TCC, DCC Disorders and GGAD Transport Strategy procipils including  1-6.1.2 Disorders programs for market facilities to record designation of the comparable strategy.  1-6.1.3 That there will be no significant strenges in rand capacity for printer well-dies on  1-6.3.3 That there will be now. — will be designed to provide self- and appropriate overagements to facilities warking, cycling and public tompose provides.		
		3.1	Noise and Vibration	Estimated number of people likely to be affected by transport related noise with the scheme within 50m.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  65 desilings within 100m.  Moves halfic to rear of apt block from current road layout	Significant comparative advantage over other options  Operational buffic repeats only affects I develop Pedestrian crossing will have impact during constructor. 47 develops within 100m of both vehicular roote and pedestrian crossing. Chip 1 properly within 100m of the vehicular roote.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Operational traffic impacts only affect it dealing. Pediatrian crossing will have impacts charge construction. 125 dealings within 150m of both vehicular notes and pediatran  crossing. City 1 properly within 100m of the vehicular route.	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options 114 devilings within 100m. Noves halfo to new rooks away from current routs and therefore impacts on properties.		
		3.2	Air Quality and Climate	Local air quality effects. No of number of receptors within 50m.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Moves traffic to near of apt block from current road layout, 39 deellings within 50m plas apt blocks that traffic has been moved from front to back. Embodie carbon for new bridge.	Significant comparative advantage over other options Productivine crossing will have impacts during communication. 14 desellings plus apt block sizins 55m of production crossing. Cloy! I property within 50m of the vehicular route or consistent traffic. Two separate bridges will increase enthodied carbon for this option.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Pedestrian crossing will have impacts during construction. 3 dwellings plus agit blocks within 50 m of pedestrian crossing. Only 1 properly within 50 m of the vehicular route of operational halfic. Undergass may discrease embodied carbon over overtridge option.	Eignificant comparative disadvantage over other options.  Moves traffic to new route away from current route and therefore impacts on properties. 22 desilings within 50m jobs some a number of alg blocks. This option also brings additional traffic to proximity of a school (highly sensitive receptor). Additional roud infrastructure would increase embodied carbon for this option.		
3	Environment	3.3	Landscape and Visual (including light)	Key landscape characteristics affected. Effects on listed bey views; Impact on landscape character.	One composition dealerancing execution regions.  One individual process in suitable those way register register on usual self- trapplicate value register for selfing of 100 Locks on Fragi Cours and in broad for  Objects COURS of Fraging Consequence Wine  Objects COURS of Fraging Consequence Wine  Objects COURS of Fraging Consequence Wine  Francis Cours of the Cours of the Cours of the Cours of  Objects of the Cours of the Cours of  Objects of the Cours of  Objects of the Cours of  Objects of	Agreement of how are symptomic region of the beautiful process of the state of the	Aggreent of all a very implicated regard to the should are of the solution. Name of the solution is a state of the solution in the solution in the solution is a state of the solution. So the solution is a state of the solution in the solution contribute in the sol	Depth and compared to the contract of the cont		
		3.4	Biodiversity (flora and fauna)	Potential compliance/conflict with biodiversity objectives; Indirect impacts on protected species, designated sites; Overall effect on nature conservation resource.	, Some comparative advantage over other options  Hydrologically connected to South Dakin Bay and Rhee Toka Eshawy SPA, No- risk of LSE. Potential impacts to Royal Canal pRHA. Demolston of old Mill lane buildings may impact bale.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Hydrologically connected to South Dublin Bay and River Tolka Estuary SPA, No risk of  LSE Potential impacts to Royal Canad pNHALoss of vocadiand, marsh, treeline and heligron habitat.	Significant comparative disadventupo over other options Permanent loss of habitat & disturtance to Light-bellied Brent Goose (Cli of SPAs) which are known forage in algrificant numbers at Asthoon Playing Pitches, Project could acree in for AA, Polential impacts to Royal Canal pNetA. Habitat loss.		
		3.5	Cultural, Archaeological and Architectural Heritage	Overall effect on cultural, archaeological and architecture heritage resource. Likely effects on RPS, National Monuments, SMRs, Conservation areas, etc. Number of designated sites/structures (by level of designation) directly impacted by scheme (landtake)	Expellent comparative disadvantage over other options. Over Impacts on gale lodge, entrance and demans associated with Ashtown H (MPS 0002), indeed repeats on mill and outwaldings (MPS) and Parlietations Hospital (extractive of architecture mett). Potential direct impacts on archaeological deposits that may survive in gravefield areas and path of form cod way.	Significant comparative disadvantage ever other options  Direct impacts on River Tolka and former demission landscapes associated with Ashbrox (IUPS) & Ashrown Lodge, Polarinal direct impacts on activate/optical deposits that may survive in greenfall areas.	Significant comparative disadvantage arear other option: Direct impacts on enfrance and demense associated with Ashbown Ho (PPD 0000). Indirect impacts on mil and outbuildings (IPPS) and Pelishatene Ho (phructure of architectural month, before impacts on careal and lock (IPPS).	Significant comparative advantage over other options  No dived impacts predicted upon alteralizations subject to statutory protection.  Potential direct impacts on achievelogical deposes that may survive within generated areas.  - Some comparative advantage over other options		
		3.6	Water Resources	Overall potential significant effects on water resource attributes likely to be affected during construction and operation.	Underpass excavations pose potential risk to Groundwater quality. Has some comparative disadvantage over other options.	Crossing of Totals as within floodplain creating polential increase in flood risk to map flooting labor.  Creating opterfail parkway for polishesh is Total a River resulting in requires impacts to White Cualify.  White Caselly, the Company option and with its Crossine succurritions also posse potential risk to Crossine accurations also posse potential risk to Crossine and an an application of companying and administration of the sea subjection of companying and administration control of the distinct and the sea subjection of the companying and administration control of the distinct and control of the control of	Crossing of Tolka is within floodplain creating potential increase in flood risk to resightowing backs.  The property of the property of pollutents to Tolka River resulting on negative impacts to Water Quality.  Options & has some comparative disadvantage over other options.	htes some comparative advantage over other options.		
		3.7	Agriculture and Non- Agricultural	Overall impact on land take & property. Number of properties to be impacted/acquired. Likely temporary or permanent severance effects, etc.	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options.  The non-agricultural impact will involve the acquisition three public properties to commented properties, and hor residential properties. The agricultural impact will have a probared impact on an equity herbiding (Aubhoun Riching Basiles).  Some comparative advantage over other options.	Significant comparative disablentage ever other options  The non-agricultural impact will involve the acquisition of three molecular properties, sporting outside, loss public bodies and three commencial properties. The agricultural impact will have a professor living commencial properties. The agricultural impact will have a professor investigation of the properties of the professor investigation of the properties of the professor investigation of the professor	Some comparative advantage over other options.  The non-agricultural impact will involve the acquisition of one residential property, for a specific powers, force public bodies and no commercial properties. Will have another advantages over other options given the reduced impact of the padeatries / cycling overhelding of the rail line and careal.  Some comparative advantage over other options.	Eignificant comparative disadvantage over other options. The encapticultural impact will involve the acquisition of no residential properties, a sporting sprund, these public bodies and three commercial properties. Option 6 with have a significant impact on the sports club lands and an the development lands North East of the Relativity.		
		3.8	Geology and Soils (including Waste)	Sols and Geology and likely impact on geological resources based on preliminary/likely construction details. % of soil resources to be developediemoved. Existing information relating to potential to encourter contemnated land High- level assessment based on the likely structured works required and the potential for ground contamination due to historic landilis, plis and quarries.	Underforing option mass that some materials may aim, which could possibly southful for mass whethere on the project. This is believed by an associate impact of interfering in the case and ending interest which would require specific contributions of the project of the foreign and contribution. (Other register)		This spirits comprises guidestein cycle bridge over the crant and reflexe, and additional everthrige, entendments teach and associated works used of Aribines. The souther strong of the Indicities will enter a spirit supplies applicant generalized works along the compression of the Indicities will explain supplies applicating search and works along the compression in the Indiana and Indiana. The Indiana are also in the Indiana and Indiana and Indiana.			
		3.9	Radiation and Stray Current	Overall likely impact on existing sources of electromagnetic radiation.	Comparable to other options All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.	Comparable to other options  All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.	Comparable to other options All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.	Comparable to other options All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.		
		4.1	Impact on Vulnerable Groups	Do options address the needs of vulnerable groups. How do they compare to one another in this regard		Comparable to other options  All options introduce ramped and slapped access to replace at grade access over the level crossing. The ramped access incorporate maintaining production of 5% and are inhamently tanger than the original access access. The options provide for segregation from the live reliable.	Comparable to other options.  All options introduce ramped and slepped access to replace at grade access over the level crossing. The samped access is corporates maximum gradents of 5% and are inheretally longer than the original access routes. The options provide for segregation term the lave raising.	Comparable to other options.  All options inhotoce mapped and stepped access to replace all grade access over the level crossing. The ramped access incorporates maximum gradelints of 5% and are inherently longer than the original access notes. The options provide for aregraphic from the law realises.		
4	Accessibility & Social inclusion	4.2	Stations Accessibility  Social Inclusion	Quantification of increased service levels to the vulnerable groups.	Comparable to other options All options address the need for access to the station to an equivalent degree	Comparable to other options All options address the need for access to the station to an equivalent degree  Some comparative disadvantage over other cotions	Comparable to other options  All options address the need for access to the station to an equivalent degree  Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Comparable to other options All options address the resed for access to the station to an equivalent degree.  Some comparative advantage over other options		
		4.3	Social Inclusion	Comparative assessment of service levels impact including severance to all groups (Severance of local communities through removal of level crossings without connection would fair worst under this heading).	Significant comparative advantage over other options  Providing for vehicular, pedeshina and cycle access is appropriate. All options provide for equivalently in this regard.  Diverted distance route 577m (1.1x diversion route)	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Providing for vehicular, padeaties and cycle access is appropriate. All options provide for equivalently in this regard.  Civerfied distance route 705m (1.6x diversion route) but estating vehicular route severed.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Providing for vehicular, pedestrian and cycle access is appropriate. All options provide for equivalently in this regard.  Coverfield distince souls 705m (1.5x diversion route) but existing vehicular route severed	Some comparative advantage over other options  Providing for vehicular, pedestrian and cycle access is appropriate. All options provide for equivalently in this regard.  Diverted distance route 1. New (2x diversion route)		
		5.1	Rail Safety	Safety for Rail users – removal of LC positive in this respect	Comparable to other options  All Options remove rail - road interface	Comparable to other options All Options remove call - road interface	Comparable to other options  All Options remove rail - road interface	Comparable to other options All Options remove rail - road interface		
5	Safety	5.2	Vehicular Traffic Safety	Quality of Access for these road users, lengths of diversions, removal of interface with rail and other modes of transport	Occupants to characteristics of Comparable to other options of options make equivalent high quality provides for vulnerable rand users. All options revoke for high quality access to all rand users. Options 3 and 6 keep traffic in the village, Options 6+48 and 4+80 provide free flow for through traffic but require disvention for local traffic.	Comparable to other options  All options make equivalent high quality provision for valentable residuents. All options provide for high quality screen to all read users. Options and to keep traffic in the village. Options 4-6a and 4-6b provide their flow for through traffic but require diseasion for fice largette.	Comparable to other options Af options make equivalent high quality provision for vulnerable road users. All options provide for high quality access to all road users, Options 2 and Exemp smittle the village, Options 4-6a and 4-6b provide free flow for through traffic but require divention for focal traffic.	Companish to other options  Miloptions make equivalent high quality proxision for valuerable most users. All options provide for high quality access to all most users. Options 2 and 6 leap traffic in the elitigs, Options 4-th and 6-th provide free flow for though 1 artific but require diversion for local traffic.		
		5.3 6.1	Pedestrian, Cyclist and Vulnerable Road user Safety Connectivity to adjoining cycling	Quality of Access for these road users, removal of interfaces  Analysis of the extent that the scheme connects with cycle	Comparable to other options Diverted datance route 577m (1.1x diversion route) Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options  Diverted distance route 796m (1.6x diversion route)  Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options Diverted distance route 798m (1.6x diversion route) Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options Diverted distance route 1.1km (2x diversion route) Comparable to other options		
6	Physical Activity	6.2	facilities  Permeability and local connectivity opportunity	tracks.  Journey Time and lengths of diversions for active modes and numbers affected. Analysis of the connectivity between level crossing and green areas/key affractions related to active mode.	The scheme should include cycle tracks on the approaches to realise the observed of the Cycle Nations (that observed the Cycle Nations) (the Comparable to other options  Listing connectivity will be enhanced by the removal of the obstacle posed by the estiming level crossing.	The schemes ahould include cycle tractor on the approaches to realise the objective of the Code Network Plan   Comparable to other options  Caiding connectivity will be enhanced by the removal of the obstacle posed by the esisting very consisting.	The scheme should include cycle tracks on the approaches to realise the objective of the Cycle Nedersk Plan. Comparable to other options.  Listing connectivity will be enhanced by the removal of the obstacle posed by the existing loved crossing.	The scheme should include cycle tracks on the approaches to realise the observior of the Cycle Nature Plan.  Comparable to other options.  Existing connectivity will be enhanced by the removal of the obstacle posed by the actating level crossing.		
F		Crite	eria	Months HEAD	Option 2	Option 4 & 4s	Option 4 & 4b	Option 6		
1	Economy		omy		Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options		
2		Integr			Significant comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options		
3		Enviror	nment social inclusion		Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Comparable to other options	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options  Comparable to other options	Some comparative advantage over other options  Comparable to other options	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options  Comparable to other options		
5	Accessibil	Safe			Comparable to other options  Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options  Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options  Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options  Comparable to other options		
6	P		Activity		Coreparable to other options	Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options		
E	Prefer	red Opt	ion Ranking		1	4	3	2		
	Comment		nent							



		DART+ Maynooth Line - MCA Stage 2										
						Level Crossing Assessment						
		Parameter		Criteria	(Quantitative/ Qualitative)	Option 2 Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Option 4  Some comparative advantage over other options					
					of option, land costs, acquisition costs and temporary works	Option 2 incorporates a longer bridge than Option 4 but has a shorter raid alignment. The bridge associated with Option 2 will be more difficult to build than that of Option 4 Comparable to other options	Option 2 incorporates a longer bridge than Option 4 but has a shorter road alignment. The bridge associated with Option 2 will be more difficult to build than first of Option 4.  Comparable to other options.					
Part	1	Economy	1.2	Long Term Maintenance costs	structures and maintaining level crossings versus removing them Benefits to vehicular traffic through	Maintenance costs for roads and bridge will be largely equivalent for each option  Comparable to other options	Maintenance costs for roads and bridge will be largely equivalent for each option  Comparable to other options					
			1.3	Traffic Functionality /economic benefit	reduction in journey time lengths and delays through removal of level crossings. Consideration of potentially longer routes for traffic.	Some improvement injourneytime; potential for induced trips; diversion required for local nesidents. Negligible impact to journey times for up to 193 vehicles during peak hours.	Some improvement in journey time; potential for induced tigs; diversion required for local residents.  Negligible impact to journey times for up to 100 vehicles during peak hours.					
			2.1	Transport Integration	Impact on scope for and ease of interchange between modes. Impact on the operation of other transport annices both dange construction annices both dange construction nodes and facilities; Pochocal washing and wait trees associated with reterhanges. Model shift figures during construction and operations. Changes to journey times to transport nodes.	nsidents.	Companies to safer splace.  Some representating-inversions, pulmetal for included that, develor regulars for local residents.					
Procession of the Company of the Section of the Company of the C	2	Integration	22	Land Use Integration	Impact on land use strategies and regional and local plans. Assessment of Support for land self-actors local land use and planning. Including local land use and planning including of profession of project in relevant local and regional planning documents.	The option is expected by the relational and regional planting policy curries, expectically with his other and the DECE. The DECE description in Date March, whose read the Carling laws of the control of the CECE and the CECE description in Date March (who can be a few Carling and Carling and Carling an	This against a agoonal by the solition and suppose planning pales committy, especifically with the control of the season's languaged. Frequent and is all to the Tables of particular seasons where the control of the season's languaged frequent and colors and in a seasoning pales in languaged and proposed frequently and analyses of the season of colors and in a seasoning pales frequently and analyses of the seasoning pales are self-or the colors and pales are seasoning colors and colors. In the colors and the colors and the colors and the colors and pales described colors and colors					
Part			2.3	Geographical Integration	Impact on improvement of external infes. Dealer to link various geographical — mostly meetar due to localised nature of the level crossings. Overall electrification scheme would be highly positive.							
Environment  13 Markey and Closelan  14 And Country and Closelan  15 Lond and graphy reflects for the country of the country o			2.4	Other Government Policy	Smarter Travel, Investment Programmes, rail safety,							
Service of the control of the cont			3.1	Noise and Vibration	Estimated number of people likely to be affected by transport related noise with the scheme within 50m.							
Private content   Private   Privat		Environment	3.2	Air Quality and Climate	Local air quality effects. No of number of receptors within 50m.	Companible to other options  Only 1 dwelling within 50m	Comparable to other options  Only 1 dwelling with 52m					
3   Environment   34   Social footnotes from Section			3.3	Landscape and Visual (including light)	Key landscape characteristics affected; Effects on listed key views; Impact on landscape character.	Companion to other options and impact to the control of the contro	Comproposate to either options  Paparetal pigefacts industrya and south impact for handsing in Lithinitism Caseds eatile (Paparetal pigefact) industrya and south industrya (Paparetal pigefact) industrya (Paparetal pig					
Section   Agriculture and Non-Agriculture   Section   Agriculture   Ag	3		3.4	Biodiversity (flora and fauna)	blodings by objections (ordered	Companible to other options  Hydrologically connected to Scoth Dation Bay and Rown Tolka Estuary SPA. No risk of LSE.  Potential impacts to Royal Carel pRMA. Loss of Teeden, bedgerow and agricultural grantiend habitats.	Companies to other options  Hydrologically corrected to South Calainstay and Row Total Enlary SPA. No nix of USE.  Plantial impacts to Royal Canal (ARA). Significantly peaker has of teelow, feedgenow and applicability (peaker) has been.					
Agriculture and Non-Agricultural  3.7 Agriculture and Non-Agricultural  3.8 Agriculture and Non-Agricultural  3.9 Agriculture and Non-Agricultural  3.0 Consequence of the origination to the impossion of the imp			3.5	Cultural, Archaeological and Architectural Heritage		Companible to other options Indirect impacts on canal and canal bridge (RPS 0711) and Lutrelations ACA Potential direct impacts on archaeological deposits that may survive ingreenfield areas.	Comparable to other options  Indirect impacts on careli (PPS 0711) and Lutwilldown ACA. Potential direct impacts on anchaeological deposits that may survive in generated areas.					
Accessibility & Social Inclusion  A production and flow of product Surface Sur			3.6	Water Resources	Overall potential significant effects on water resource attributes likely to be affected during construction and operation.	Some comparative disable edge over other options  Proposed routs indicated to have increased flood risk compared to other options. Potential register import on unforce water quality diving operational phase. Potential register in proposed in prop	Some comparative distributings over other replicat  Proposed route indicated to have increased four risk compared to other options. Prioritide register impact on authors where quality during operational phase. Prioritide frequisite impact on groundative parally during contribution phase. These cores comparative dissolved operand one operational parally during contribution phase. These cores comparative dissolved operand one operations.					
Safety   Social Bulletin   S			3.7	Agriculture and Non-Agricultural	Overall impact on land take & property. Number of properties to be impacted/acquired. Likely temporary or permanent severance effects, etc.		Some comparative advantage over other options  Under Options, there is an impact on an equive form holding resulting in land seemence of lands. Sociale and of the Ballerestone local reset from the flampact and equive facilities. Will have a significant advantage ever other options due to the reduced impact on agricultural property.					
Accessibility & Boolal			3.8	Geology and Soils (including Waste)	on geological resources based on preliminary/likely construction details. So facil resources to be developed inervowed. Existing information relating to potential to encourter contaminated land. High- level assessment based on the likely structural works required and the potential for ground contamination due to historic landfills, pils.							
4.1 Repetit on Valenche Congress and Accessability & Social Inclusion  4.2 Septimina Accessability & Social Inclusion  4.3 Social Inclusion  4.3 Social Inclusion  4.3 Social Inclusion  5.5 Safety  5.2 Velocial Traffic Safety  5.2 Velocial Traffic Safety  5.3 Palentine, Cycyclat and Valenches  5.4 Social Inclusion  5.5 Safety  5.6 Congression Safety S			3.9	Radiation and Stray Current	Overall likely impact on existing sources of electromagnetic							
Accessibility & Social Inclusion  4.2 Stations Accessibility  5.1 Social Inclusion  5.1 Not Barley  5.1 Not Barley  5.2 Wildow's Traffic Safety  5.2 Wildow's Traffic Safety  5.3 Perdon, Cypin and National  6.3 Companies to the Station Accessibility  5.3 Perdon, Cypin and National  6.4 Companies to Station  6.5 Companies to Station  6.5 Companies to Station  6.6 Companies to Station  6.7 Companies to Station  6.8 Companies to Station  6.9 Companies to Station  6.9 Companies to Station  6.1 Social Inclusion  6.1 Companies to Station  6.2 Companies to Station  6.3 Companies to Station  6.4 Companies to Station  6.5 Companies to Station  6.5 Companies to Station  6.6 Companies to Station  6.7 Companies to Station  6.8 Companies to Station  6.8 Companies to Station  6.8 Companies to Station  6.8 Companies to Station  6.9 Companies to Station  6.1 Companies to Station  6.1 Companies to Station  6.2 Companies to Station  6.3 Companies to Station  6.4 Companies to Station  6.5 Companies to Station  6.5 Companies to Station  6.7 Companies to Station  6.7 Companies to Station  6.7 Companies to Station  6.8 Companies to Station  6.9 Companies to Station  6.9 Companies to Station  6.9 Companies to Station  6.9 Companies to Station  6.1 Companies to Station  6.1 Companies to Station  6.2 Companies to Station  6.3 Companies to Station  6.4 Companies to Station  6.5 Companies to Station  6.5 Companies to Station  6.5 Companies to Station  6.7 Companies to Station  6.7 Companies to Station  6.8 Companies to Station  6.8 Companies to Station  6.9 Companies to Station  6.0 Companies to Station  6.0 Companies to Station			4.1	Impact on Vulnerable Groups	impacts on low recome groups, non- car owners, people with a disability. Quantification of increased service	Companible to other options	Comparable to other options					
Social Inclusion     Compression from the section of the control of the cont	4		4.2	Stations Accessibility								
5.1 Au Sudrey  5.2 Velocial Traffic datey  5.2 Velocial Traffic datey  5.3 Pediatrian, Cyclet and Valuentia  6.3 Pediatrian, Cyclet and Valuentia  6.3 Pediatrian, Cyclet and Valuentia  6.3 Connectifully is a significing cyclet  6.3 Connectifully is a significant gradual or control or c			4.3	Social Inclusion	Quartification of service levels impacts including severance to all groups (Severance of local communities through removal of level crossings without connection would fair worst under this heading).	Companishin to other options  Diverted distance scale \$47m (2 for diversion route)	Compundàn to ether options  Diserbel distance route 948m (3.1% disension route)					
Palestrian, Optital and Valencelle  2.3 Palestrian, Optital and Valencelle Based over Eufery  Based over Eufery  Connectivity in Application of Control of International Co			5.1	Rail Safety		NE overbridges have a significant advantage as they are a great coosing alternative	All overbridges have a significant advantage as they are a great crossing alternative					
See comparison of contract of the contract o	5	Safety	5.2	Vehicular Traffic Safety	Quality of Access for these road users, lengths of diversions, removal of interface with rail and other modes of transport	Companible to other options  reading a segregated crossing would have a significant advantage as vehicular traffic is not crossing the line rail	Configurable to other options  reciding a segregated creasing would have a significant advantage as vehicular toffic is not creasing the law of the control					
6.1 Connectivity to addition grating Auditoria Connectivity to addition and the solution that the Auditoria Connectivity to Auditoria Connectivity of the solution to the solution connectivity of the solution connectivit	L		5.3	Pedestrian, Cyclist and Vulnerable Road user Safety	Quality of Access for these road	Diverted distance route SE7m (2.0x diversion route)	Diverted distance route 948m (3.1x diversion route)					
			6.1	Connectivity to adjoining cycling facilities								
NNAME OF JUSTICE TRADE	6	Physical Activity	6.2	Permeability and local connectivity opportunity	Journey Time and lengths of disversions for active motion and numbers affected. Analysis of the cornectivity between level crossing and green receasiley attractions related to active mode							

	Criteria	Option 2	Option 4
1	Economy	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options
2	Integration	Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options
3	Environment	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options
4	Accessibility and social inclusion	Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options
5	Safety	Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options
6	Physical Activity	Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options
	Preferred Option Ranking	2	1
	Comment	<u> </u>	<u> </u>



DART+ Maynooth Line - MCA Stage 2												
	Blakestown Level Crossing Assessment											
	Parameter		Criteria	Sub-Criteria (Quantitative/ Qualitative)	Do-Minimum (Management) Option - Close level crossing and provide no alternative	Option 1 Closure of the level crossing and provision of a pedestrian overbridge that is approx. 7m in elevation.						
		1.1	Construction and Land Cost	Assessment of cost of construction of option, land costs, acquisition costs and temporary works	Some comparative advantage over other options  There is minimal capital cost associated with this option. There may be costs associated with severence in respect of the closure	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options  There is significant capital cost and construction difficulty associated with this option is comparation to Option 1. These may be costs associated with severence in respect of the closure.						
1	Economy	1.2	Long Term Maintenance costs	Steel options vs concrete options for structures and maintaining level crossings versus removing them	Significant comparative advantage over other options  The closure of the level crossing would remove the maintenance requirement of the level crossing	Some comparative advantage over other options  An overbridge would increase decrease maintenance requirements are overparing costs over a level crossing.						
		1.3	Traffic Functionality /economic benefit	Benefits to vehicular traffic through reduction in journey time lengths and delays through removal of level crossings. Consideration of potentially longer routes for traffic.	Comparable to other options  Displacement of very low traffic volumes (up to 13 vehicles during par- bours) ceto alternative soules; increase in journey times for local residence.	Comparable to other options  Comparable to other options  Comparement of very low traffic volumes (up to 13 vehicles during per hours) onto alternative rootie; increase in journey times for local residence.						
		2.1	Transport Integration	Impact on scope for and ease of interchange between modes. Impact on the operation of other transport services both during construction and in operation. New interchange nodes and facilities: Reduced watering and wait times associated with interchanges. Modal shifting figures during construction and operations. Changes to journey times to transport nodes.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Reduction in local permeability. Reduced access to Royal Careal Cyc.  Route.	Same comparative advantage over other options  Reduction in local permeability						
2	Integration	22	Land Use Integration	Impact on land use strategies and regional and local plans. Assessment of logical plans (local plans, Assessment of logical plans, Assessment of logical plans, Assessment of logical plans (local plans) and plans (local plans) and local plans (local plans) and local plans (local plans) plans (local plans) and local plans (local plans)	Organization from cytolers and the company of the c	Companies within expenses.  All out work to region in a month of the second to the sec						
		2.3	Geographical Integration	Impact on improvement of external links. Desire to link various geographical – mostly neutral due to localised nature of the level clossings. Overall electrification scheme would be highly positive.	Comparable to other options  Shortest diversion route 3.2km (1 fix diversion route)	Comparable to other options  Shortest diversion route 2.2km (1 tx diversion route)						
		2.4	Other Government Policy	Integration with Government Policy, Smarter Travel, Investment Programmes, rail safety, electrification etc	Some comparative disadvantage over other options.  Closing the crossing with no other alternative meets government policy but not ideal.	Significant comparative advantage over other options  Providing webbular and pedestrian is ideal						
		3.1	Noise and Vibration	Estimated number of people likely to be affected by transport related noise with the scheme within 50m.	Significant comparative advantage over other options  No impace	Scene comparative disadvantage over other options  Removes which srafts but will have some short term construction impacts.						
		3.2	Air Quality and Climate	Local air quality effects. No of number of receptors within 50m.	Comparable to other options  Removes vehicular truffic and minimal construction phase	Comparable to other options  Removes vehicle staffs; therefore requiring longer stips on alternative noves for same staffs; however removes localised staffs impacts. Some whore seem construction impacts.						
		3.3	Landscape and Visual (including light)	Key landscape characteristics affected; Effects on listed/key views; Impact on landscape character.	Significant comparative advantage over other options  No impact on existing landscape or visual characteristics	Sons comparative disadvantage over other options  Assumes minimal physical intervention in environment. No impact on existing landscape or visual characteristics						
		3.4	Biodiversity (flora and fauna)	Potential compliance/conflict with biodiversity objectives; Indirect impacts on protected species, designated sinse; Overall effect on nature conservation resource.	Significant comparative advantage over other options  No impact on existing Biodiversity (fore and fauna)	Eignificant comparative disadvantage over other options  Hydrologically connected to South Dublin Bay and River Tolka Estuary  50%. No risk of LSE. Petertal Impacts to Royal Canal pHMA string from the contraction of new pedestrian bridge.						
3	Environment	3.5	Cultural, Archaeological and Architectural Heritage	Overall effect on cultural, archaeological and architecture heritage resource. Likely effects on PPS, National Monuments, Sillera, Number of designated altestitutcures (by level of designation) directly impacted by scheme (landtake)	Significant companies adversage and other options  No repaid on eating Cultural, Archeeological and Architectural Transage	Some comparation disable rings over other options  Indirect impacts on cased bridge (69%) Polential direct impacts on an interesting facilities that may accord in permitted mass.						
		3.6	Water Resources	Overall potential significant effects on water resource attributes likely to be affected during construction and operation.	Some compansive advantage over other options  Benoves vehicular traffic bourn politicate and minimal construction phases. The Do Minimum Cytion has some compansive advantages over other options.	Sons congunitive disadvantage over other options  Potential negative impact on groundwater quality during construction phase. Nes some comparative disadvantage over other options.						
		3.7	Agriculture and Non-Agricultural	Overall impact on land take & property. Number of properties to be impacted lacquired. Likely temporary or permanent severance effects, etc.	Significant comparative advantage over other options  No impact on Agriculture and Non-Agricultural seasols	Systical corporate discining over different plans Will impact on agricultural and non-agricultural property. There is no impact on access to lands though there will be increased inswel for vehicular journeys to / from R146.						
		3.8	Geology and Soils (including Waste)	Soils and Geology and likely impact on geological resources based on preliminary/likely construction details. % of soil resources to be developed/removed. Existing information relating to potential on encounter contaminated land. High-level assessment based on the May structural works required and the potential for grown contemination of to historical smithing, pits and quarters.	Significant (semparative adventings over other cystoms  As impact on Geology and Soile (including Waste)	Supplicate companies in the instance area of the option.  These is melanois report associated with the bedge construction, it is applicated number of discussion bandsion business associated with application involves of discussion bandsions business associated with application (-right hidge construction to the considered the inspect of the production of the inspect of the inspect countries of t						
		3.9	Radiation and Stray Current	Overall likely impact on existing sources of electromagnetic radiation.	Comparable to other options  All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.	Comparable to other options  All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.						
		4.1	Impact on Vulnerable Groups		Some comparative disadvantage over other options  There is currently a very low level of usage of the crossing. The impar of removing the crossing is considered to be modest.	Some comparative advantage over other options  There is currently a very low-level of usage of the crossing. The benefit in providing pedestran / cycle access is considered to be modest.						
4	Accessibility & Social inclusion	4.2	Stations Accessibility	Quantification of increased service levels to the vulnerable groups.	Comparable to other options  All options are comparable from this perspective.	Comparable to other options  All options are comparable from this perspective.						
		4.3	Social Inclusion	Quantification of service levels impacts including severance to all groups (Severance of local communities through removal of level crossings without connection undulatin worst under this heading).	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Shortest diversion route 3.2km (11x diversion route)	Some comparative advantage over other options  Shortest diversion route 3.2km (11x diversion route), pedestrain, and cylist and non mointeed road warrs calereed for						
		5.1	Rail Safety	Safety for Rail users – removal of LC positive in this respect	Some Comparative advantage over other options  Cooling the cooling will remove the interface between rail and other traffic	Some comparative disadvantage over other options.  Coding the cooling would have a slight disadvantage to call went as they would have to an alternative mode.  Construction stage orderly impairs associated with this option are conclined to be sportizately greater than be Option 1.						
5	Safety	5.2	Vehicular Traffic Safety	Quality of Access for these road users, lengths of diversions, removal of interface with rail and other modes of transport	Companishe to either options  Cooling the crooking with no abstractive avoids have a slight disabstrates as it would disert traffic onto longer rawles	Comparable to other options  Cloding the crossing would have a slight disadvantage as call users as they would have as on abternative router.						
		5.3	Pedestrian, Cyclist and Vulnerable Road user Safety	Quality of Access for these road users, removal of interfaces	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  There is currently a very love level of usage of the crossing. The impa- of removing the crossing is considered to be modest.	Significant comparative advantage over other options  Corples Distance from access to farm to R148 junction 270m relained						
	Dharian	6.1	Connectivity to adjoining cycling facilities	Analysis of the extent that the scheme connects with cycle tracks.	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options.  No cycle tracks on the immediately surrounding road network, but the closure of the level crossing would reduce access to the Royal Canadrana Cesenway. See also Transport Integration above.	Significant comparative advantage over other options  Severance overcome by provision of direct replacement.						
6	Physical Activity	6.2	Permeability and local connectivity opportunity	Journey Time and lengths of diversions for active modes and numbers affected. Analysis of the connectivity between level crossing and green areasikey attractions related to active mode	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options  Severance of existing connectivity	Significant comparative advantage over other options  Severance overcome by provision of direct replacement.						

	Criteria	Do-Minimum (Management) Option - Close level crossing and provide no alternative	Option 1  Closure of the level crossing and provision of a pedestrian overbridge that is approx. 7m in elevation.
_			
1	Economy	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options
2	Integration	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options
3	Environment	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options
4	Accessibility and social inclusion	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options
5	Safety	Some comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative advantage over other options
6	Physical Activity	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options	Significant comparative advantage over other options
	Preferred Option Ranking	1	2
$\perp$			
	Comment		



	DART+ Mayrooth Line - MCA Stage 2  Clonsilla Level Crossing Assessment											
	Parameter		Criteria	Sub-Criteria (Quantitative/ Qualitative)	Option 1	Option 2	Option 4					
		1.1	Construction and Land Cost	Assessment of cost of construction of option, land costs, acquisition costs and temporary works.  The temporary works costs associated with each of the schemes are largely equivalent.	Significant comparative adventage over other options  Oue to the reduced scale of this option the capital cost is significantly lower than that of the other option. The land acquisition costs are all least than those of other options.	Significant components distributed and cover other options.  This scheme has an estimated capital cost significantly higher than Cyston and equivalent Cyston 4. This option affects a significant number of matients and option the control of the control option 4 could be controlled to the controlled contro	Significant compositive dissibusitage over other options to pure conspectation of the option testings in these reades approach is allowed to accommodate partial and testing t					
1	Economy	1.2	Long Term Maintenance costs	Steel options vs concrete options for structures and maintaining level crossings versus removing them. All options result in closure of the level crossing	Comparable to other options  All options proposed are in structural concrete and would have equivalent long term maintenance needs.	in addition this option all require the previous of a polarisation / cycle bridge the level crossing equilessing to Cycle in Cycles in . Comparable to other options.  All options proposed see in structural concrete and would have equivalent to term maintenance needs.	Them will be algorithment construction steps impacts with implementation of the profess most among of the coats.  Comparable to either options  gAll options proposed are in structural concrete and would have equivalent long term maintenance needs.					
		1.3	Traffic Functionality /economic benefit	Benefits to vehicular traffic through reduction is journey time lengths and delays through removal of level crossings. Consideration of potentially longer routes for traffic.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Displacement of traffic coto alternative routes; increase in journey time for local residents. Significant impact on journey distance for up 245 whiches during past hours.	Some comparative advantage over other options  a Some improvement in journey time, potential for induced trips, divension required for local residence. Negligible impact on journey times for up to 340 which is during peak boxin.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Some improvement in journey lime; potential for induced tips; diversion require for local residents. Negligible impact on journey times for up to 345 vehicles during peak hours.					
2		2.1	Transport Integration	Impact on scope for and ease of interchange between modes. Impact on the operation of other transport services both during construction and in operation. New interchange nodes and facilises, Reduced walking and wal- times associated with interchanges. Modal shift figures during construction and operations. Charges to journey times to transport nodes.	Same comparative disadvantage over other options  Severance of existing vehicular access to train station car parking to south of the railway. Diverted access will be available.	Some comparative adventage over other options  To come improvement in journey time, potential for induced tipe; diversion required for local residents.	Some comparative adventage over other options  Some improvement in journey time, pulseful for induced trips; divension require for local residents.					
	Integration	22	Land Use Integration	developed the Duthis MASP, where one of the Quisting Principles for the Growth of this area is this grated Transport and Land Use "To Grous growth along existing and proposed high quality public transport corridors and nodes or the expanding public transport network and its support the delivery and integration of Stationness's DART expansion and LIMAS extension programmes, and Morto Link, while maintaining the capacity and addy of strategic transport networks".	Some compartment advantage and other options.  When limit by Figgs OF region his downspared of his project and conceptions of the project of	And the control of th	These immediates disablements one office determined by a finite of the proof of the					
		2.3	Geographical Integration	Impact on improvement of external links. Desire to link various geographical – mostly neutral due to localised nature of the level crossings. Overall electrification scheme would be highly positive.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Shortest diversion route 3.8 km (8.4x diversion route)  Comparable to other persons	Some comparative advantage over other options  Diverted distance route 75tm (1.6x diversion route)	Some comparative advantage over other options  Diverted distance node 894m (2 for divention node)					
		2.4	Other Government Policy	Integration with Government Policy, Smarter Travel, Investment Programmes, rail safety, electrification etc	Closing the crossing with no other alternative meets government policy but not ideal  Significant comparative individuals over other options	Providing whicular and podersion is ideal  Significant companished disadvantage over other options	Moviding whicular and pedestrian is ideal  Sees comparative disadvantage over other options					
		3.1	Noise and Vibration	Estimated number of people likely to be affected by transport related noise with the scheme within 50m.	Pedestrian crossing only- will have no operational noise impact.  Significant comparative advertage over other options	53 dwellings within 100m.  Significant comparative disadvantage over other options	20 deellings within 100m. Slightly preferred over Option 2 due to lower number properties within 100m.  Some comparative disadvantage over other options.					
		3.2	Air Quality and Climate	Local air quality effects. No of number of receptors within 50m.	Pedestrian cossing only will have no operational impact locally. This option will result in some additional operational phase vechels kin increase due to rerouting, extent of impact on traffic would determine if this was preferred or not.	24 dwellingswithin 50m. Due to longerliengthandoverbridge, therewould be a higher volume of embodied carbon in this option.	12 dwellings within 50m. Slightly preferred over Option 2 due to lower number of properties within 50m and lower construction materials (embodied carbon).					
		3.3	Landscape and Visual (including light)	Key landscape characteristics affected; Effects on listed key views; Impact on landscape character.	Some comparative advantage over other options: Proposed shackers will impact some trees at entrance to Beach Park, Very significant impact on exidential properties on Clonella Read Lach Chrone and Weavaris Wall sorth of the carea, and along the season Lach Chrone and Weavaris Wall sorth of the carea, and along the season of the carea and the season of the carea of the carea of the carea and the carea of the carea of the carea of the carea control to the carea.	Control companies falled region of the control	Export and companions and analysis of the control of the care of the control of the care o					
3	Environment	3.4	Biodiversity (flora and fauna)	Potential compliance/conflict with biodiversity objectives: Indirect impacts on protected species, designated sites; Overall effect on nature conservation resource.  Overall effect on outbrait archaeolocieal and	Some comparative disadvantage over other options Hydrologically connected to South Dublin Bay and Rhue Tolka Estuay SPA, No risk of LSE, Petertail Injuncts to Royal Canal pNH4. Minor habitat loss in comparation to other options Some concernative advantage over other codions	Some comparative disadvantage over other options elydrologically connected to South Challe Bay and River Talks Estuary SPA. No risk of LSE, Potential impacts to Repail Canal pNHA. Loss of woodland, sealins, hedgenow amontensity grassland and well grassland habitats.	Sees comparative disadvantage over other options  Hydrologically connected to South Dublin Bay and River Toba Sattary SPA. No incl of LEG. Present imports to Ryglic Canap (FAAL South Arrivals) and set grassland habits. Clinical imports to Systic Canap (FAAL South Arrivals) and passion to veterant-basich tree in the field where option  some comparative advantage over other options.  Some comparative advantage over other options.					
		3.5	Cultural, Archaeological and Architectural Heritage	Overlas tesect on coustrat, at chasteriogical servi- anchibecture haritage resource. Likely effects on RPS, National Monaments, SMRs, Conservation areas, etc. Number of designated sites/structures (by level of designation) directly impacted by scheme (landtake)	Some comparative advantage over other options Indirect impacts on canal bridge, canal and signal box (RPS)	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Over Impact on demantal handcapes associated with Genemocut and  Over Impact on Capital (IPPS). Polential direct impacts on antheological deposits that may survive within greenfield areas.  Note also impacts for Option 1.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Direct impact on dements landscape associated with Beach Park Ha. Indirect impact on canal (RPS), Potential direct impacts on archaeological deposits the may earlies within greenfield areas.					
		3.6	Water Resources	Overall potential significant effects on water resource attributes likely to be affected during construction and operation.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Potential Positive impact on surface water quality during operation.  Potential negative impact on groundwater quality during construction phase. Option has some comparative advantages over other options.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options Potential negative impact on surface water quality during operational phase. Potential negative impact on groundwater quality during construction phase. Has some comparative disadvantage over other options.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options Proposed node indicated to have increased food risk compared to other options. Potential inegative impact on surface water quality during operational phase. Has some comparative disadvantage over other options.					
		3.7	Agriculture and Non-Agricultural	Overall impact on land take & property. Number of properties to be impacted/acquired Likely temporary or permanent severance effects, etc.	Significant comparative advantage over other options.  Options 1 and 4 were identified as having significant advantages over options due to the limited landstea and impact associated with Option 1 and the reduced direct impact associated with Option 4.	Significant comparative dissolvantage over other options.  Under Option 2, the non-agricultural impact will involve the acquisition of five nesidential properties. The agricultural impact will result in land severance on	Significant comparative advantage over other options  Options 1 and 4 were identified as having significant advantages over option 2 also to the initied tendules and inpact associated with Option 1 and the reduced direct impact associated with Option 2 and the reduced direct impact associated with Option 4.					
		3.8	Geology and Soils (including Waste)	Soils and Gedogy and likely impact on geological resources based on preliminary/likely construction datals. So all resources to be developed immoved. Existing information relating to potential but the construction of the construction of the construction of the likely state of the likel	Some Congarine abstracting one chart speak.  Lower Hi input requirements compared to other options. All agains, as large to require piling. The shift of encountering conteminated and considered law for all options.	Assignment in the process of the pro	Anappearls may be a served on the property of the Anappearls may be a served on the property of the Anappearls may be a served on the Anappearls of the Anap					
		3.9	Radiation and Stray Current	Overall likely impact on existing sources of electromagnetic radiation.	Comparable to other options  All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.	Comparable to other options  All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.	Comparable to other options  All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.					
_				Impacts on low income groups, non-car owners, people with a disability. Quantification	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options  All options make an equivalent level of provision for vulnerable groups.					
		4.1	Impact on Vulnerable Groups	of increased service levels to these groups; Quantification of infrastructure and rolling stock improvements aimed at these groups; distribution of consumers surplus	All options make an equivalent level of provision for vulnerable group.  Vehicular diverted distance route 3 film (E.4x diversion route).	All options make an equivalent level of provision for valnerable groups.  Vehicular access calened for locally.  Note also impacts for Option 1.	Vehicular diverted distance route 974m (1.9x diversion route).					
4	Accessibility & Social inclusion	4.1	Impact on Vulnerable Groups Stations Accessibility	of increased service levels to these groups ; Quantification of infrastructure and rolling	All option make an explaint front of provision for outwerfalls group Vehicute destrict distincts rates 2 liters (8 et diversion male)  Einem comparative distancempts over either applices Copping Distance born Consilla Road junction to Protentions road deller relatived.	Note also impacts for Option 1.  Some comparative activatings over other options  Climated vehicular route distance 755m (1 for downton route)	Vehicular diverted distance trade SFA in (1.0s divension rande)  Some comparative advantage over other options  Diverted vehicular male distance SFA (2.0s divension rande)					
4				of increased service levels to these groups; Quantification of infrastructure and rolling stock improvements aimed at these groups; distribution of consumers surplus Quantification of increased service levels to the vulnerable groups.	Sees compartied disablessing most other spines beyond fillman but Carella Raid junction in Protestion road distinction and control of the Protestion road distinction of the Carella Raid (Carella Raid ). Some comparties disablesting in not other spines States comparties disablesting in not other spines States and the Carella Raid (Carella Raid) and option alternative products for radially repeated junction.	This aim impact for Cycles 1  Series compared and impact and impac	Same comparative privately some other options  Disorted velocial mode distance \$56+0 (2 to disease mode)  Same comparative advantage over other options  Covered disease route \$56+0 (2 to disease mode)  All options advantage mode options mode)					
4		42	Stations Accessibility	of increased service levels to these groups : Quartification of interactions are deligited states of the control of the control of the control of distribution of consumers are pile. Quartification of consumers are pile. All options address provision for mobility impaired person, pedestines and cyclista booally. Quartification of service levels impact and control of the control of Quartification of service levels impact and control of Quartification of Quartification of Service levels impact and Quartification of Service levels impact All Quartification of Service levels Quartification of Service levels Quartification of Service Service Quartification of Service	Some composite distributings one other agrees.  Depth Channe here Contill final justice in Protestive and distribution in the Contill final justice in Protestive and distribution and class resident.  Some composite distribution on when agrees.  Destined deveral may 1 long 1/4 of each result in particular distribution of the contillation of the	Name and requests for Control 1.  Share comparative and interrupt tree of white specimes.  Control wholisher make distance Table (if an dimension under State of Stat	Same companion activation por other systems  Destrict exhibit make distance \$1500 GO destrois make)  Same companion activation por other systems  Counts distance make \$1500 GO destrois make)  All palms activate provincia					
4		42	Stations Accessibility  Social Inclusion	of increased annice levels to these groups - control of the control of the control of the control of the such reprovements and of these groups - control of the control of the control of the control of the control of the control of the her understate groups - All options address provision for mobility impaired persons, pedestress and cyclats holding severance to all groups (Generation control of the control of the control of the Countrol of the control of the control of Countrol of the control of the control of Countrol of the control of Countrol of the control of Countrol of the control of Countrol of Coun	Date comparatio disablemage over other system.  Opposit Disease have Conside Plans' products in Princetones and other resident.  Seen comparation disablemage and other systems.  Comparation in other systems.	Note that you the Confine I.  Sees comparable admining over all the update.  Consider declare rook distance Table (1 to dismost under  Sees comparable admining over all the product of the confine I to the confi	Same comparable software part of the option  Construct ordinate tools district 26 to discover county  Same comparable software 26 to 2 to discover county  Same comparable software county of the option  Construct discover soft to 25 to discover county  All pattern actions producted to might graphers, seeked one of all pattern actions produced to might graphers primary, seeked one of all pattern actions produced to might graphers primary, seeked one of all patterns actions produced to action actions of all patterns actions produced to action actions action actions actio					
	inclusion	4.2	Stations Accessibility  Social Inclusion  Rail Safety	of forceased annicle seeks to these goods of the control seeks of the goods of the	Consecution of Secular	Note that instructs for Copyring 1.  Seem of company and the copyring 1.  Seem of company and the copyring 1.  Construct or foliation as the distance Table () for distance mode)  Seem or companying a distance part of the companying to the copyring and copyring to the co	Some comparable software part of the option  Control of reliable tools distract \$84.00 (in the second read)  Some comparable software \$84.00 (in the second read)  Some comparable software are of the option of the second read)  All options action as products or could be present, production and all options actions or could be present and as a second ready of the sec					
	inclusion	4.2 4.3 5.1	Stations Accessibility  Social Inclusion  Rail Safety  Vehicular Traffic Safety	of horseast among	Compared and administration of their agreement of the agr	Note that requests to Couldness (  Serve comparative all stranges over a relative spitches)  Construction of the County of the C	Some comparation activities over other options  Described entertainer make distance \$1.00 c. (2) and among models  Some comparation activities (2) and among models  Described distance make \$1.00 c. (2) and among models  All options activities or productive models (2) and among models  All options activities or productive models (2) and among models and activities					

	Criteria	Option 1	Option 2	Option 4
	_			
1	Economy	Some comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options
2	Integration	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options
3	Environment	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options
4	Accessibility and social inclusion	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options
5	Safety	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options
6	Physical Activity	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options
E	Preferrred Option	 1	3	2
	Comment			



	DART+ Maynooth Line - MCA Stage 2  Coolmine Level Crossing Assessment										
	Parameter		Criteria	Sub-Criteria (Quantitative/ Qualitative)	Option 1	Option 3 with Pedestrian Cycle Bridge	Option 4 with Pedestrian Cycle Bridge	Option 6			
		1.1	Construction and Land Cost	Assessment of cost of construction of option, land costs, acquisition costs and temporary works	Some comparative disadvantage over other options This option is online and consequently serves the need for productions (option access. The option is online and consequently continued and will be more difficult to build the office of the option such as (OCC, OCH of and OCH. The ownerfloor of the option is less than October.	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options Less properly demokration than 6, less frontage than other options. This option is less separas "ann Option 4 but more expensive than all other options due to the need to build an addition."	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options  this option would require construction of a pedestrian cycle bridge at the level crossing as a Cyption 0, meaning Inc. Stripps are required to deliver this option including an opening or Cyption 0, meaning Inc. Stripps are required to deliver this option including an opening	Some comparative advantage over other options  of the extent of this option is more curtailed than other options and much of the scheme to build offline. It has significant impact on the existing parking facilities at the train exist			
1	Economy	1.2	Long Term Maintenance costs	Steel options vs concrete options for structures and maintaining level crossings versus removing them	and 4 and comparable to Collon 6  Some comparable disadvantage over other options  Overbridges would reduce maintenance requirements over a level crossing. Bridge option	bridge at the level creating.  Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Overbridges would reduce maintenance requirements over a level creative, thirdge options would determine overall maintainance coult. Two bridges he was not would determine overall maintainance coult. Two bridges he has not valided embandments.	bridge over the canal  Significant comparative disadvantage over other options  An opening overtridge world significantly increase the maintenance requirements. These bridges have and valided enhancement.	The overall cost of this option is comparable to Option 1 but less than other options.  Some comparative advantage over other options.  Overbridges would reduce maintenance requirements over a level cossing. Bridge opti			
		1.3	Traffic Functionality /economic benefit	Benefits to vehicular traffic through reduction in journey time lengths and delays through removal of level crossings. Consideration of potentially longer routes for traffic.	would determine overall maintainance coate - length bridge here with valid embarkmen.  Some comparative disadvantage over other options.  All options are equivalent in term of trittle inchmissibly as the animal wooses is provided integra narrow contriber does to the winting level creating. Reventions are shorter for Option 1 and 5 than Options 3 and 4 options 2 and 4 remove through shaffs them Cookinine Rose providing saled for sold shaffs.	social determine overall maritaneous costs. Two bridges here and valled entherkments  Some companishe advantage over other options  40 options are equivalent in terms of safet, functionality as the alternative access is provide- sioning a narrow control or class to the existing level crossing. Disversions are shofter for Options and 0 Year Option 3 and 4, Option 3 and 4 serrow strough safet, from Coolerins Read providing maler for local stafe.	bridges have and sailed embalment  Some comparative advantage over other options  NI options are equilected to term to stratic functionality as the alternative access is provided  long a name control code to the sailing level crossing. Development as shorter for Cyption  I and 6 man Options 3 and 4 Options 3 and 4 remove through traffic from Coderine Rose  providing real for boots stratific.	would determine owned resistances costs. Validat here and vasible demarkments  Some comparative disadvantage over other options  of options are equivaled to items of traffic functionality as the alterable access incided along a names contrict done to the earlier loved coasting. Dismotion are when  or options a leaf of their Options a leaf of loved or and of resistance are without  ordinated from their contributions. Options a leaf of resistance month staff is the  contribution and providing relief for local traffic. This option impacts on the parking facility  the train staff.			
		2.1	Transport Integration	Impact on scope for and ease of interchange between modes. Impact on the operation of other triansport services both during construction and in operation. New interchange nodes and facilities, Reduced walking and walt times associated with interchanges. Model shift figures during construction and operations. Changes to journey simes to transport nodes.	Some comparative dissolvantage next other options  represent distributing between modes, subject to satisfactory access as to the initial or represent distributing to the contract of the required appearant represent the contract to the extension operation of the required appearant represent access to the extension operated with the extension of the contract or represent will not be accessed for the contract or represent will not be accessed for the contract or represent will not be accessed for the contract or represent will not be accessed for the contract or represent will not be accessed for the contract or representation of the contract or representation or repr	Significant computative schedulings over other options.  Rescaled access to bath station car paid. General improvement in convendintly and journey.  The prevailed of a posterior and cycle bridge at the seating level creating provides the basicess for NAU. The expression of the supplies of the seating involved and jours & and in the seating level creating provides the basicess for NAU. The expression of the supplies of the seat has decided and jours & a faid restlict all creations are given as the seating level.	Eignificant compension attention, over other options  Necoulid access to trial relation car pain. General representation connectivity and journey  The provision of a patientian and cycle bridge at the existing level creaming provides the be- excess for NAU. The supergister of through staffs from Nau & staff and you & not in tall,  per profess no system staffer.	Significant companies of blackwarage over other options reproved inscribing between modes, subject to artification yearned to text additional subject to the production of the bedge over the cond and taking was a must off an amendating on the agreements to the bedge over the cond and taking was a must off an amendation of the segment depression representations to the shift distinct one park will be amendation of the segment depression of the segment of the segment of the production of the segment of the segment of the segment of the Amenda contains of the production, capts and must produce to the segment and account most office of the production of the models prograded users. This may seem to the segment of the segment of the segment of the segment of the segment of the segment of the segment of the segment of the segment of the segment of the segment of the segment of the segment of segment of the segment of segment of segm			
2	Integration	22	Land Use Integration	impact on hard usen disabagion and regional and local pains. Assessment of appoint the data size factors local regional and local pains. Assessment of appoint for local size factors local factor is relievant book and hardware programs and the size of the siz	Some comparative also unlegs over other options.  The contract of the first of the contract is a contract of the contract of t	Some comparative discharging and their against some control of the	Some temporal of Parish Arrings and State (State Control of State Control	Annual companions absenting near other options.  Institute to it. In Program the passion of the page on the Opposite to the Companion of the page on the Opposite to the Companion of the page on the Opposite to the Opposite			
		2.3	Geographical Integration	Impact on improvement of external links. Desire to link various geographical – mostly neutral due to localised nature of the level crossings. Overall electrification scheme would be highly positive.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Ouglan Distance traffic (et ) product to monitored 20th interiors. Coaling correctionly we see where it is no distance to the pile resting and committee to see where it is no distance point by the resting less committy for productions and option, about that the rose will be more crossion.	Some comparative distributions or other options.  Dented distribute real: Sain (J.3: distribution make) for care. Existing conventiely will be enhanced by the removal of the delated possed by the existing level covering by presenting only continued by the removal of the delated possed by the existing level covering by presenting only cycles, about the removal will be more continued. The removal of the report possed to the continued of the results of the removal of th	Some comparative disadvantage ever other options.  Counted distance make 1 dans (3.3 disension make for care. Easiling correctivity will be enriched by the memoid of the distance power by the extension by the memoid of the distance power by the extension by the memoid of the distance power by the extension for predictation. The memoid of the road collection for the counter of th	Some comparative adventage over other options  Proport Debanes with high produce to monobodic 550m actions: Existing concedible  of monocally have may of the colour point by the earling best criming for  monotative and option, which the tends will be more challeng.			
		2.4	Other Government Policy	Integration with Government Policy, Smarter Travel, Investment Programmes, rail safety, electrification etc	Comparable to other options  Providing for sehicular, pedestrian and cycle access is appropriate	Companable to other options  Housiding for webicular, pederation and cycle access is appropriate	Comparable to other options.  Hoolding for whicular, pedentias and cycle access is appropriate.	Comparable to other options  moviding for vehicular, pedestrian and cycle access is appropriate			
		3.1	Noise and Vibration	Estimated number of people likely to be affected by transport related noise with the scheme within 50m.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Online option will have some additional impacts to the current shadon. 246 developps within 150m. On the approaches to the railway the road will be elevated. This may require the obsolution of roles in advantage above road level. This option develop effects may properties than Options 3, 4 and 6.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options. More traffic to new location and will impact different properties to the current level crossing doubles, which so Must be part of the core to be scheme option. So which we have been considered to properties in the vicinity and properties in the vicinity of the statistic level counting. No impact during the operational phase. On the opportunities of the part of t	Some companies of landswings over other options.  20 destings with office that they do not not not be achieved project of good of the convention of country and the convention of the convention of the convention of the country of th	Some comparative advantage over other options  latinus softs to new location and will impact additional properties to the correct consists  (E) Gealings within 60th. On the approaches to the solivery the read will be elevate  This may require the introduction of notes barriers above road level.			
		3.2	Air Quality and Climate	Local air quality effects. No of number of receptors within 50m.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options.  On line option. 160 destings within Som.	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options  Moves tallful to new location and will impact different properties to the current crossing, 200 overlags, within John.	Some companifive disadvantage over other options  Moves balls to new incession and will impact offlowers properties to the current country. 174 dealings within 50th. Patentially less enholded carbon than option 3 due to undertrige rather than over bridge in construction phase.	Significant comparative advantage over other options  Moves staffic to new location and will repart different properties to the current counting 47 feetings within licits.			
		3.3	Landscape and Visual (including light)	Key landscape characteristics affected; Effects on listed key views; impact on landscape character.	Come companion soforming over other options  Onto controlling option is likely to have applicant impact on vasual anting of adjacing ventorial impacts and followers and followers and applicant impacts and impact and impact and impacts	Office and other parties of the property of th	Significant companies for such as of the process of	Some comparable solventings over other options  Describing eight will have very applicant should impact on middertail properties at Describ. Chemy thin and Residence.  Lower thin and Residence.  Expertise Strips and Serves to Collegide CH of If Trigg Eventopment Plant Describe of Installation properties at Describe Colors.			
3	Environment	3.4	Biodiversity (flora and fauna)	Potential compliance/conflict with biodiversity objectives; indirect impacts on protected species, designated sites; Overall effect on nature conservation resource.  Overall effect on cultural, archaeological and specific	Some Comparative advantage over other options  Hydrologically connected to South Dalah Blay and Pileer Total Extract SPA. No risk of LSP  Potential impacts in Space SPA. No risk of LSP  Potential impacts in Space SPA. No risk of LSP  Could read in I stud of reads and the space of the space state of read read in court of the space of the space state of read in court. I count of the count of th	Stens comparative disarbantage over other options  (Hydrologically connected to South Dabin Bay and Riser Tokas Estracy SPA. No risk of LSS  Hydrologically connected to South Dabin Bay and Riser Tokas Estracy SPA. No risk of LSS  Experient Trees and problem.  Comparable to other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options Hydrologically connected is South Cubin Bay and River Toba Enhany SPA. No risk of LE Priserial impacts to Physic Cereil PAPA. Loss of woodback word, amening grassland, southered two and preferred.  Comparable to other options	Same comparative solvestage over other options  List, Patentia impacts to South Dublin Bay and River Tolks Estuary SPA, No rais, List. Patentia impacts to Rigari Care (PMR). Case of weodonal and south habitat. Li repaid to habitat has been sound other option.  Comparable to other options.			
		3.5	Cultural, Archaeological and Architectural Heritage	architecture heritage resource, Likely effects on RPS, National Monuments, SMRs, Compensation area, etc. Number of designated sites/structures (by level of designation) directly impacted by scheme (landtake)	Polential direct impact on RPS 0087 bridge over canal  Significant comparative advantage over other options	Potential indirect impact canal (RPS) Potential direct impact on RPS 0607 bridge over canal  Significant compansive advantage over other options	Potential indirect impact canal (RPS) Patential direct impact on RPS 6007 bridge over canal  Some companies disadvantage over other options	Potential index of Impact canal (IPPS) Potential direct impact on RPS 0007 bridge over canal Significant compansive advantage over other options			
		3.6	Water Resources	Overall potential significant effects on water resource attributes likely to be affected during construction and operation.	Profession companies report in the old sign provincies as worth only of the first properties of the control of	ignoridat otro reggio in para de lasta de lasta conscioles a monte segui de la compartica del compa	Inhered more wagain repeat on bod of a dang scond-circ as works may go be for the second of the sec	Principle convergence improve the final risk planty contribution as sent years plant of the planty contribution as sent years plant or sent of the plant of the contribution of the contri			
		3.7	Agriculture and Non-Agricultural	Overall impact on land take & property.  Number of properties to be impacted/acquired. Likely temporary or permanent severance effects, etc.	Some comparative advantage over other options This option impacts the access to residential properties and directly fronts a large number asses.  100 deadings within 50m.	Same comparative disadvantage over other options  The non-agricultural impact will insolve the acquisition of two residential properties under Op  3 - 203 dwellings within 50n.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  The non-opticultural report will include the acquisition of two residential properties under Option 3 - CH dwellings within Som.	Figuritization comparative disadvantage over other options  Four residential properties may need to be acquired for Cyslon 6. Cyslon 6 will have significant impact on the Coolmine Station can park - 67 dwellings within 50m			
		3.8	Geology and Soils (including Waste)	Sols and Geology and Skely impact on geological resources based on preliminarylishing construction details. So of soil resources to be developed/removed. Existing information relating to potential to encounter contaminated land. High-level assessment based on the likely structureal works required and the potential for ground contamination due to historic landfills, pics and contamination due to historic landfills, pics and	Some comparation distallmentage over other options:  Overbridge options require increased fill import to the site (Monor regulars).	Same compression distallmentage over other options  Constrolige options require increased fill import to the also (Monor register).	Some comparative solventage over other options  Comparatively lover fill import requirements due to the lover alignment (Monrespiece) by the comparatively form of the comparative of th	Some companion disaborating over other option.  Some made ground on-site. Owntrings option require increased fill import to the a (Micro registra)			
		3.9	Radiation and Stray Current	Overall likely impact on existing sources of electromagnetic radiation.	Comparable to other options  All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.  Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options  All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.  Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options  All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.  Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.  Comparable to other options			
		4.1	Impact on Vulnerable Groups	Do options address the needs of vulnerable groups. How do they compare to one another in this regard	All options introduce ramped and elepted access to replace at grade access over the law crossing. The ramped access incorporates maximum gradients of 5% and are inherently longer than the original access routes. The options provide for segregation from the live railway.	All options introduce ramped and stepped access to replace at grade access over the level crossing. The ramped access incorporates maximum gradients of 5% and are inherently long than the original access routes. The options provide for segregation from the like railway.	All options introduce ramped and stepped access to regime at grade access over the live grassing. The ramped access incoporates maximum gradients of 5% and are inherently. Grager than the original access routes. The options provide for segregation from the live salesty.	All options introduce ramped and stepped access to replace at grade access over the crossing. The ramped access incorporates maximum gradients of 5% and are inheres longer than the original access routes. The options provide for segregation from the is salaque.			
4	Accessibility & Social inclusion	4.2	Stations Accessibility	Quantification of increased service levels to the vulnerable groups.	Comparable to other aptions  Providing for vehicular, pediestran and cycle access is appropriate. All options provide for application.  Comparable to other aptions.	Companitie to other apticos  Providing for vehicular, pedestrian and cycle access is appropriate. All options provide for   specializing  Companitie to other apticos	Comparable to other options  Providing for vehicular, pedestrian and cycle access is appropriate. All options provide for  regulation for   Comparable to other options.	Comparable to other options  Droyding for vehicular, pedeshien and cycle access is appropriate. All options provide  comparable to other options  Comparable to other options			
		4.3	Social Inclusion	Quantification of service levels impacts including severance to all groups (Severance of local communities through removal of level crossings without connection would fair worst under this heading).	Providing for whicular, pedestrian and cycle access is appropriate. All options provide for expensions:  Comparable to other options	Providing for whicular, pedestrian and cycle access is appropriate. All options provide for expenditurity  Companible to other options	Providing for vehicular, pedestrian and cycle access is appropriate. All options provide for equivalently  Comparable to other options	Providing for verboder, pedestrian and cycle access in appropriate. All options provide explainments:  Comparable to other options			
		5.1	Rail Safety	Safety for Rail users – removal of LC positive in this respect	Comparable to other options as Options sensor call - said insertice  Comparable to other options	Companible to other options  65 Options remove rail-read interface  Companible to other options	Comparable to other options  All Options remove rail - road interface  Comparable to other options	Comparable to other options All Options remove rail - road interface Comparable to other options			
5	Safety	5.2	Vehicular Traffic Safety	Quality of Access for these road users, lengths of diversions, removal of interface with rail and other modes of transport	All aptions provide a segregated crossing and introduce significant callety enhancement as which are not crossing the live raisory Significant companying advantage over other options	all opdone procide a suggestant crossing and introduce agroficant sufery enhancement as vehicular sufficie not crossing the her railway.  Some comparative advantage over other options	as options provide a regargated oracing and introduce significant softing enhancement as esticular traffic is not creasing the live solvery.  Some comparative advantage over other options	al options provide a suprepried crossing and introduce significant calling enhancement as whitecher staffic is a set crossing the less belowy Significant comparative advantage over other options			
		6.1	Pedestrian, Cyclist and Vulnerable Road user Safety  Connectivity to adjoining cycling facilities	Quality of Access for these road users removal of interfaces  Analysis of the extent that the scheme connects with cycle tracks.	All options make equivalent high quality provision for valnerable read users. Cystons 2 and houseup provided for valnerable read users at the level crossing aggregated from through safet. This aggregation is not available for Options 1 and 6 in Comparable to other aptions	All options make equivalent high quality provision for vulnerable road users. Options 3 and 4 however provided for vulnerable road users at the level crossing suggested from through roads. This suggested is not available for Options 1 and 5.  Companable to other options.	All options make equivalent high quality provision for vulnerable road users. Options 3 and towers provided for vulnerable road users at the level crossing segregated from through saffer. This segregation is not available for Options 1 and Inc.  Comparable to other options.	All options make equivalent high quality provision for vulnerable road users. Options 3 4 houseurs provided for unbreachin road users in the level creating asymptotic from the solid. This segregation is not available for Options 4 and 5. Comparable to other options.			
6	Physical Activity	6.2	facilities  Permeability and local connectivity opportunity	Journey Time and lengths of diversions for active modes and numbers affected. Analysis of the connectivity between level	All options provide for integration with adjoining and proposed cycle facilities  Significant comparative advantage over other options  Casting connectivity will be enhanced by the removal of the obstacle possed by the existing connectivity will be enhanced by the removal of the obstacle possed by the existing water cossessing. Offline aptions provide the additional benefit of providing pediatrian and cycle proceedings as the obstacles make the association state.	All options provide for integration with adjoining and proposed cycle facilities  Significant Comparative advantage over other options  During connectivity will be enhanced by the removal of the obtained posed by the existing of the obtained posed by the obtaine	No options provide for integration with adjoining and proposed cycle facilities  Significant compansive advantage over other options  Baining connectivity will be enhanced by the removal of the obstacle posed by the existing word costing. Office options provide the additional benefit of providing pedestrian and cyclesomethy in the obstacles make the purpose.	All options provide for integration with adjoining and proposed cycle facilities  Significant comparative advantage over other options  Existing connectivity will be enhanced by the removal of the obstacle posed by the exist of country of the obstacle posed by the exist of country of the obstacle posed by the exist of country of the obstacle posed by the exist of country of the obstacle of the hand and only of the obstacle of the hand and only of the obstacle of the hand and only of the obstacle of the hand put on an other obstacle of the hand and only of the obstacle of the hand of			
		opportunity crossing and given available of artistic mode crossing and given available to active mode.  Criteria		reliated to active mode	connectably at two locations rather than just one.  Option 1	consectivity at two locations states than just one.  Option 3 with Pedestrian Cycle Bridge	convectivity at two locations rather than just one.  Option 4 with Padastrian Cycla Bridge	cycle connectivity at less locations rather than just one.  Option 6			
1	Economy			Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options				
2		Integr			Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options			
4	Accessibil	Enviro	nment social inclusion		Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Comparable to other options	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options  Comparable to other options	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options  Comparable to other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Comparable to other options			
5		Saf			Some comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Significant companitive advantage over other options	Some comparable advantage over other options			
6	P	hysical	Activity		Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options			
	Prefer	red Opt	don Ranking		2	1	4	3			
	Comment				Best of western options	No Advantage over Option 3					



	DART+ Maynooth Line - MCA Stage 2											
	Porterstown Level Crossing Assessment  Personater Criteria (Quantitativel Ontion 4 Ontion 2 Ontion 3 Ontion 4											
	Parameter		Criteria	Sub-Criteria (Quantitative/ Qualitative)	Option 1  Some comparative advantage over other options	Option 2  Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Option 3	Option 4				
		1.1	Construction and Land Cost	Assessment of cost of construction of option, land costs, acquisition costs and temporary works	Construction costs are higher for this option than for other options due to the height in the visiduct and the largift of many needed to reach duck level. In additional cost of the at grade access tracks to the visiduct.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options.  The construction cost of this option is less equivalent to the cost of Option 4. It is cheaper than Options 3 and 1.	Significant comparative disadvantage, over other options.  The construction cost of this option is higher than Options 2 and 4 due to the provision for creasing over the existing buildings of the sports ground. The option also includes for realignment of a section of Portentionn Road south the railway. The land acquisition costs of this option are higher than for other options.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  The construction cost of this option is less equivalent to the cost of Option 2. It is chasper than Options 3 and 1				
1	Economy	1.2	Long Term Maintenance costs	Steel options vs concrete options for structures and maintaining level crossings versus removing them	Some comparative advantage over other options  Reinhoroid concrete shudares are articipated. These have infallively received cogoli- maintenance costs. The costs are equivalent for all options.	Gome comparative disadvantage over other options  Reinforced concrete attachanes are anticipated. These twee relatively endeet ongoin  resintenence costs. The costs are equivalent for all options.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Reinforced concrete structures are anticipated. These have relatively mode orgoing maintenance costs. The costs are equivalent for all options.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Rainforced conceils shuckases are articipated. These have miletively modest orgoby maintenance costs. The costs are equivalent for all options.				
		1.3	Traffic Functionality /economic benefit	Benefits to vehicular traffic through reduction in journey time lengths and delays through remova of level crossings. Consideration of potentially longer routes for traffic.	Comparable to other options  Dispincement of loss teeffs evolumes (between 55 and 110 whickes) during peak hours only alternative modes; increase in journey times for local residents, New Link road alterably survives for community failer.	Comparable to other options  Displacement of low hollow observes (between 55 and 110 whickes) during peak hours on alternative rodes; horsess in journey times for local residents, New Link road sheadly serves for controller testic.	Comparable to other options  Displacement of low terffix volumes (between 55 and 110 vehicles) during pe source often alternative codes, tensors in journey times for local residents, No Link road already serves for commuter traffic.	Comparable to other options  Displacement of the Isafic volume (between 55 and 110 whildes) during peak- hairs and salamather notes; increase in journey times for local residents, New Link road already serves for commuter traffic.				
		2.1	Transport Integration	Impact on scope for and ease of interchange between modes, impact on the operation of our control of the operation of and in operation. New interchange nodes and facilities, Redocted waiking and wait times associated with interchanges. Model shift figures during construction and operations. Changes to journey times to transport nodes.	Come comparative disadvantage over other options  Some indirect access provided for pediatries and cyclinis, but less preferentile than other options. No access provided for other temporal modes.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Passonable access provided for padestriers and cyclinia. No access provided for other transport modes.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Passanable access provided for pedieshare and cyclade. No access provide for their howaper modes.	Some comparative advantage over other options  where the contractive advantage over other options  where the contractive access provided for pedestriens and cyclists. We access provided for the transport modes.				
2	Integration	22	Land Use Integration	Impact on land use strategies and regional and local plans. Assessment of support for land use factors local and one and planning, inclusion of pages in relevant plansing, inclusion of pages in relevant plansing of columents.  All options are supported by the national and regional planning policy contents, specifically with a PP and the SEE. The PERSI disveloped the PP and the SEE. The PERSI disveloped PRSI on the PP and the	Comparable in other options was claim. In Fingel Or segons the dissistance of the project and Option MITO Support formed Claims and the Art is proposed upon DAPT Common MITO Support formed Claims and the Art is proposed upon DAPT Common MITO Support formed Claims and the Art is proposed upon the pro	Comparable to other options  biscal land, for Topic OF require to dissequent of the project code Objection  of To "Support forms" Extension and the Objection of the Comparability of the Comparabilit	Compare die to other applices.  Nacio Mari, Tengo CP reposito Na disvisione of the project order.  Nacio Mari, Tengo CP reposito Na disvisione of the project order.  Describe Mari, Tengo CP reposito Na disvisione of OFF repositore of the Project of National Action of the Project of National	Comparable to other against  as invalidated. In Prog. CP support, the desirations of the project order  Statistical to Prog. CP support to the desirations of all top reject order  Copyring. If The "Support is more of these and the ATTA's implementing to  Statistical to the support is more of the area of the ATTA's impressive to the  Statistical to the support is an ATTA's impressive to the support in the  Statistical to the support is an ATTA's impressive to the support in the  statistical to the support in the support is an ATTA's impressive to the  statistical to the support in the support is an ATTA's impressive to the  statistical to the support is an ATTA's impressive to the support in the  statistical to the support is the support in the support is and  statistical to the support is the support in t				
				support me delivery and megination of BusConnects; DART expansion and LUAS extension programmes, and Metro Link, while maintaining the capacity and safety of strategic transport networks*.	Issues paper sings Area 2019). This option does not include goids access or windows.  The option would support poderfaire access at this business and stape provided and after provided direct connect to other fluides public transport services via Printersbown viadulat.  Comparable to other options	Sports accesses at this location. However it would also impact on open space provision about pit Cland.  Comparable to other options  Comparable to other options	Cyption 3 would confirm to support the future development of lambs zowed for Installection (Area and of the face Net Sylvanous NP by maintaining perfective and cycle access at this location.  Comparable to other options	jain of the Guide Augustation (Av. of parametering potaminate and good access as Cared.  Cared.  Control of the Cared.  Control of the Contr				
		2.3	Geographical Integration	to link various geographical – mostly neutral due to localised nature of the level crossings. Overall electrification scheme would be highly positive.		The existing road access at portentiown level crossing provides for single lane vehicul access. The adjacent viaduct was constructed to provide alternative vehicular access. Shortest diversion route 1.2km (2x diversion route)		The existing road access at porterstown level crossing provides for single lane valicular access. The adjacent visduct was constructed to provide alternative valicular access. Shortest diversion route 1.2km (2x diversion route)				
		2.4	Other Government Policy	Integration with Government Policy, Smarter Travel, Investment Programmes, rail safety, electrification etc Estimated number of people likely to be affected	Comparable to other options  residing for pedestion and cycle access is appropriate with presisting adjacent vehicular  access.	Comparable to other options  Providing for pedestrian and cycle access is appropriate with prevising adjacent vehicular soccess.  Some comparative advantage over other options	Comparable to other options  Providing for pedestrian and cycle access is appropriate with prevising adjacent which access	Comparable to other options Providing for pedestrian and cycle access is appropriate with previoting adjacent vehicular access				
		3.1	Noise and Vibration	by transport related noise with the scheme within 50m. All options remove through vehicular traffic from the location	Some comparative advantage over convergences  2 deading within 100m. Note that only construction along impacts expected as this is a profession, cycle creating.	deellingwithis 100m. Note that only construction stage impacts expected as this is a pedestrian, cycle crossing.	Scene comparative disadvantage over other options  27 dwelling within 100m. Note that only construction stage impacts expected a thin is a pediestran, cycle crossing.	Some compartance and arrange over conser opports  3 deading which 500m, Note that only construction stage impacts expected as this is a publishrian, typic creating.				
		3.2	Air Quality and Climate	Local air quality effects. No of number of receptors within 50m.  All options remove through vehicular traffic from	Some comparative solvantage over other options  2 dealing within 50m. Note that only construction stage impacts expected as this is a potention, cycle, crossing. All options will result in the same additional operations than which changes to emissions due to revoking traffic. No bridge iso love construction to practice.	Some comparative advantage over other options  It desiling within Som. Note that only construction single impacts expected as this is a posterior crossing. All options will result in the same additional operational phase vehicle changes to entiations e due to recording traffic.	Gorse comparative disadventage over other options  10 dwellings within 50m. Note that only construction stage impacts expecised in this is a pedestrain, cyclic crossing. Polaritally more emboded carbon due is additional construction material required. All options will result in the same additional operational phase whichie changes to emissions e due to renoulineation.	Some comparative advantage over other options  3 dwelling within 50m. Note that only construction stage impacts especialise this is as pelestrian crossing. All options will result in the same additional operators phase within changes to emissions educ to recouling traffic.				
		3.3	Landscape and Visual (including light)	the location  Key landscape characteristics affected; Effects on listed key views; Impact on landscape character.	Some comparative solventage over other options  Some comparative solventage over other options  Significant impact on here to north of comel-which provide screening for residential property.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options.  Equidical impact on lesses to north of come! which provide accessing for residential property.  Equidical impact on of discharges at level conseque.  Equidical impact on other discharges at level conseque.  Equidical impact on existing of foreign bridge, with proposals finding selevated disordly one	Significant comparative disablentage over other options.  Significant impact on coastide trees and hedgerows.  Significant impact on coastide trees and hedgerows.  Fignificant visual repeat for dis colleges at level cossing and for properties of  Missal impact on witing of Kearenh bridge, with proposed bridge develod  develop own.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Equificant impact on twen to north of count - which provide sciencing for  resoluted impactly, to the other characteristics of the other countries,  Count impact on setting of Keenan bridge, with proposed bridge stevanted density  seer.				
3	Environment	3.4	Biodiversity (flora and fauna)	Potential compliance/conflict with biodiversity objectives; indirect impacts on protected species, designated sites; Overall effect on nature conservation resource.	Some comparative advantage next other options  hydrologically connected to South Guilen Bay and flow Table Extensy SPA. No rate  5.5C. Positional impracts in Player Carel globb, Plazerade impact to securious habitat  satisfactory and the security Covers that hat the special of the Security products  being and the security Covers that hat the special on this security production  bridge them is less impact to cared contribr then option 2 and 3.	The companion discharges over other options  Post objects of the Control Edge of Row Table Edway SPA. No roke  online in the Control Edge of Row Table Edway SPA. No roke  online in edward to Edward SPA.  Online in the Control	Some temperative disabnettipe town other options  Hydrologically connected to South Dublin taley and Rover Toba Educary SPA, sake of SE. Potential impacts to Rhysi Canel pRNA: Potential repacts but tooging and roosing in existing bridge, Judicipa and lives meanly, Load of the Committee of the C	Hydrologically connected to South Dubb Bary and Flow Toba Estany STA. Its part of U.S.P. Protected impacts to Royal Comit pilots, Plantical impacts to Royal Comit pilots, Plantical impacts to bear recovered to the control of the co				
		3.5	Cultural, Archaeological and Architectural Heritage	Overall effect on cultural, archaeological and architecture heritage resource. Likely effects on RPS, National Moruments, SMRs, Conservation areas, etc. Number of designated sites/structures (by level of designation) directly impacted by scheme (landtake)	Some comparative disadrantings over other options indeed impacts on Crossing college and school house (IPPS). Pridental direct impact on archaeological disposits that may survive in greenfall areas.	Some companitive advantage over other options  Indirect repeats on Creating critisgs, infraod house, cared bridge and cared.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Indirect impacts on Creasing ontage, whoch house, cared bridge and canel	Some comparative advantage over other options Indirect impacts on Crossing college, school house, canel bridge and comit.				
		3.6	Water Resources	Overall potential significant effects on water resource attributes likely to be affected during construction and operation.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Polential negative impact on groundwater quality during construction phase. Has som comparative disadvantage over other options.  Some comparative advantage over other options.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  othertain negative impact on groundwater quality during construction phase. Has some comparative disadvantage over other options.  Some comparative disadvantage over other options.	Some comparative disadvantage over other options  Potential negative impact on groundwater quality during construction phase, this some comparative disadvantage over other options.  These comparative disadvantage over other options.	Some comparative advantage over other options  Polential regardw impact on groundwater quality during construction phase. Has some comparative disadvantage over other options.  Some comparative advantage over other options				
		3.7	Agriculture and Non-Agricultural	Overall impact on land take & property. Number of properties to be impacted/acquired. Likely temporary or permanent severance effects, etc.	The non-agricultural impacts associated with Options 1 will have significant impacts or lands (car park) used by St. Mocha's GAA club  Comparable to other options	The non-agricultural impacts associated with Option 2 will have significant impacts or lands (car pack) used by St. Mocha's GAA club  Comparable to other options	Option 3 will impact on lands used by St. Mochta's GAA club, St. Mochta's FG and St. Mochta's National School  Comparable to other options	The non-egricultural impacts associated with Options 1 will have significant impacts on lands (car pack) used by St. Mocha's GAA club  Companies to other options				
		3.8	Geology and Soils (including Waste)	Soils and Geology and likely impact on geological resources based on preliminary/likely construction details. % of soil resources to be	All options are equivalent in respect of geological and soils impact  Comparable to other options	All options are equivalent in respect of geological and solls impact  Comparable to other options	All options are equivalent in respect of geological and soils impact  Comparable to other cotions	All options are equivalent in respect of geological and soils impact  Comparable to other options				
		3.9	Radiation and Stray Current	Overall likely impact on existing sources of electromagnetic radiation.	All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.  Some comparative deadvantage over other options	All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.  Some comparative advantage over other options	All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.  Some comparative advantage over other options	All options are comparable from an EMI perspective.  Some comparative advantage over other options				
		4.1	Impact on Vulnerable Groups	Do options address the needs of vulnerable groups. How do they compare to one another in this regard	All options introduce numped and slepped access to replace all gaide access over the west creating. The numped access incorporates maximum gaiders of 5% and are reheaverly longer than the original access routes. The option provide for segregation than the less railway. The diversion for Option 1 is significantly longer than for other spotners.	All options introduce ramped and slepped access to replace at grade access over the west crossing. The ramped access toroporation maximum graderist of 5% and as reterretly longer than the original access routes. The options provide for segregation then the live milesey. The diversion for Option 1 is significantly longer than for other spitchs.	All options inhoduce sumped and slapped screes to replace at grade access over the level crossing. The remped screes incorporates maximum gradients 2% and ass inherently longer than the original access routes. The options provide for segregation from the leve makey. The diversion for Option 1 is significantly longer than for other options.	All options introduce ramped and stepped access to replace at grade access over the level crossing. The ramped access incorporates maximum grademise of 5% as an inherently longer than the original access radius. The options provide for segurgation from the live milessy. The diversion for Option 1 is significantly tonger than for other options.				
4	Accessibility & Social inclusion	4.2	Stations Accessibility	Quantification of increased service levels to the vulnerable groups.	Comparable to other options  Shortest diversion route 1.2km (2x diversion route)  Simplifying Comparable (3 and angles of the options)	Comparable to other options  Shortest diversion route 1.2km (2x diversion route)	Comparable to other options  Shortest diversion route 1.2km (2x diversion route)	Comparable to other options Shortest diversion route 1.2km (2x diversion route)				
		4.3	Social Inclusion	Quantification of service levels impacts including severance to all groups (Severance of local communities through removal of level crossings without connection would fair worst under this heading).	Diverted distance roots 1. Non (1.8x diversion roots)	Original Distance from The village junction to Portendown Road Junction 600m retain	Digital Distance from The village junction to Portendoen Road junction GCOs estated	Original Clalance from The village junction to Portendown Road junction 600m retained				
		5.1	Rail Safety	Safety for Rail users – removal of LC positive in this respect	Some comparative advantage over other options Al Options remove rall - real disertice. All other options require construction work over the rulway. This option does not.  Comparable to other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options sti Options remove rel - result intention. Option 11 the only one which does not require construction works over the raillay At Roberts are equilement to the regard  Comparable to other options	Some comparative dissolventage over other options All Option sensor rail—read interface, Option is the only one which does not require construction works over the railway All others are equivalen in this regard Comparable to other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options All Options remove rail—read interface. Option 1 is the only one which does not require construction works over the railway A deber are equivalent in this regard  Comparable to other options				
5	Safety	5.2	Vehicular Traffic Safety  Pedestrian, Cyclist and Vulnerable	Quality of Access for these road users, lengths of diversions, removal of interface with rall and other modes of transport Quality of Access for these road users, removal	The Ferninsteen violated is located close to the level consiste. This is a pre-existing facility which provides rathe access for whiching currently using the level crossing than is currently the case. All options perform equally in this regard.  Some comparative advantage over other options	The Persentative violent is located close to the level crossing. This is a pre-existing facility which provides sales access for vehicles convertify using the level crossing than is currently the case. All options perform equally in this regard.  Significant community advantage over other cotions.	The Forentzions violated is located close to the level crossing. This is a pre-existing facility which provides safer access for vehicles currently using the level crossing that a currently the case. All options perform equally in this regard.  Significant constraints advantage over other collons.	The Portenteen valuate is located close so the level crossing. This is a per-existing holiting which provides safer access for vehicles currently using the level crossing than is currently the case. All options perform equally is this regard.  Significant comparative advantage over other options.				
		5.3 6.1	Road user Safety  Connectivity to adjoining cycling facilities	of interfaces  Analysis of the extent that the scheme connects with cycle tracks.	Diverted distance rools 1. Not (Lib diversion roots)  Some comparative advantage over other options  Local severance on Podersions Rood neighble to a degree by access to Podersion Variety	Original Dialance from The village junction to Portentione Road junction 600m retains Significant comparative adventage over other options Severance overcome by provision of direct replacement.	Digital Distance from The village junction to Portensione Road junction 600 stained  Significant comparative advantage over other options  Severance overcome by provision of direct replacement.	Original Distance from The village junction to Protentiown Road junction 600m retained  Significant comparative advantage over other options  Severance overcome by provision of direct replacement.				
6	Physical Activity	6.2	Permeability and local connectivity opportunity	Journey Time and lengths of diversions for active modes and numbers affected. Analysis of the connectivity between level crossing and green areasikey attractions related to active mode	Some comparative advantage over other options  Local severance on Porfersione Road mitigated to a degree by access to Porfersion  Visduct	Significant comparative advantage over other options  Severance overcome by provision of dreed replacement.	Significant comparative advantage over other options  Severance overcome by provision of direct replacement.	Significant comparative advantage over other options  Severance overcome by provision of direct replacement.				
	Criteria			Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4					
1			Economy		Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Significant comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options				
2			Integration		Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options				
3			Environment		Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative disadvantage over other options				
4		Ac	cessibility and social inclusion		Significant comparative disadvantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options	Some comparative advantage over other options				
5			Safety		Some comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative advantage over other options				
6			Physical Activity		Some comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative advantage over other options	Significant comparative advantage over other options				
	Preferred Option Ranking			4	1	3	2					