

Appendix A

Detailed MCA table

Comparison Criteria Legend	
Green	Best performance (including cost) relative to other options
Yellow	Good performance (including cost) relative to other options
Orange	Acceptable performance (including cost) relative to other options
Red	Poor performance (including cost) relative to other options

Safety							
Technical Annex	Summary of requirements	Option Number	Description of Option	Employer's Safety		Public safety	
				Qualitative appraisal on the safety impacts on EC or railway staff	Rationale	Qualitative appraisal on the safety impacts on the public (road and cycle/pedestrian)	Rationale
				To reduce safety risks associated with construction maintenance and operations. To reduce the potential for incidents or near-misses to EC/construction staff.		To reduce safety risks associated with passengers at platform, public adjacent to the railway and road, pedestrian and cycle users at level crossings. To reduce the potential for accidents for members of the public/passengers on railway infrastructure. To reduce the potential for conflict between rail and road users.	
Works Around Dinghies Madsride Station	Provide new turnback infrastructure which will move the Train Service Specification To allow for continued movements of freight traffic to and from the Neuen Branch. Provide additional DART rolling stock stabling within the Dinghies area as per the DART stabling strategy	10	New platform at location of existing service road with new crossover following parallel access from down end of main at the station approach with no EC access to depot in peak	Yellow	Broadly similar to other options	Orange	new platform is constrained to one side by the depot and does not offer any escape routes.
		11	New platform at location of existing service road with new depot headbut to South end with new crossover from down main at the station approach	Yellow	Broadly similar to other options	Orange	new platform is constrained to one side by the depot and does not offer any escape routes.
		12	New platform at location of existing service road with new depot headbut to South end with new crossover from down main at the station approach. Southern headbut depot access only	Yellow	Broadly similar to other options	Orange	new platform is constrained to one side by the depot and does not offer any escape routes.
		20	Single Neuen Branch Platform but with no EC access to Neuen Platforms	Yellow	Broadly similar to other options	Green	new platform with escape routes to the rear into the car park.
		21	Single Neuen Branch Platform with southern headbut to depot	Yellow	Broadly similar to other options	Green	new platform with escape routes to the rear into the car park.
		22	Island Neuen Branch Platform with no EC access to Neuen Platforms	Yellow	Broadly similar to other options	Orange	island platform increases the number of platform interfaces with track, while in this option the platform escape is more constrained.
		23	Island Neuen Branch Platform with southern headbut to depot	Yellow	Broadly similar to other options	Orange	island platform increases the number of platform interfaces with track, while in this option the platform escape is more constrained.

Comparison Criteria Legend	
Green	Positive impact on accessibility and social inclusion
Yellow	Neutral impact on accessibility and social inclusion
Orange	Negative impact on accessibility and social inclusion
Red	Significant negative impact on accessibility and social inclusion

		Accessibility & Social Inclusion					
Technical Annex	Summary of requirements	Option Number	Description of Option	Accessibility		Social Inclusion	
				Rationale	Justification against the measure	Rationale	Justification against the measure
			<p>Qualitative appraisal of capacity of options to facilitate the movement of people with disabilities, or to access the rail system.</p> <p>Impact on the wellbeing of the passenger and public.</p> <p>Positive impact on passenger and public experience.</p> <p>Improve accessibility to key facilities, such as employment, education, transport and healthcare to satisfy transport demand for all trip types.</p>	<p>Capacity of options to facilitate the movement of people (either within, on to or across the rail system).</p> <p>Impact on the wellbeing of the passenger and public.</p> <p>Positive impact on passenger and public experience.</p> <p>Improve accessibility to key facilities, such as employment, education, transport and healthcare to satisfy transport demand for all trip types.</p>	<p>Qualitative appraisal of capacity of options to provide ease of access for the mobility and visually impaired.</p>	<p>Positive impact towards vulnerable groups.</p> <p>Positive impact to deprived geographic areas.</p> <p>Improvement of accessibility to public transport facilities, in particular from deprived geographic areas.</p>	
Works Around Drogheda Mainline Station	<p>Provide new turnback infrastructure which will move the Train Service Specification</p> <p>To allow for continued movements of freight traffic to and from the Navan Branch.</p> <p>Provide additional DART rolling stock stabling within the Drogheda area as per the DART+ stabling strategy.</p>	10	<p>New platform at location of existing service stand 4 with new crossover allowing parallel flows from down and up main at the station approach with no ECX moves to depot at peak.</p>	<p>Construction of a new platform adjacent to the existing platform allow easy transfer of passengers and allows passengers easy navigation to their trains</p>		<p>Assessment is based on additional walking distance or crossings allowing for provision of lifts which must be negotiated by passengers relative to their destination. 12 involves short journey, but bridge crossing.</p>	
		11	<p>New platform at location of existing service stand 4 with new depot headshunt to South and with new crossover from down main at the station approach.</p>	<p>Construction of a new platform adjacent to the existing platform allow easy transfer of passengers and allows passengers easy navigation to their trains</p>		<p>Assessment is based on additional walking distance or crossings allowing for provision of lifts which must be negotiated by passengers relative to their destination. 12 involves short journey, but bridge crossing.</p>	
		12	<p>New platform at location of existing service stand 4 with new depot headshunt to South and with new crossover from down main at the station approach. Southern headshunt depot stands only.</p>	<p>Construction of a new platform adjacent to the existing platform allow easy transfer of passengers and allows passengers easy navigation to their trains</p>		<p>Assessment is based on additional walking distance or crossings allowing for provision of lifts which must be negotiated by passengers relative to their destination. 17 involves short journey, but bridge crossing.</p>	
		20	<p>Single Navan Branch Platform but with no ECX moves to Navan Platform.</p>	<p>The construction of a single platform on the Navan branch will result in DART service platform 3 and the new platform. This will result in uncertainty in platform destinations for passengers, furthermore this option introduces extended travel distances for passengers transferring services</p>		<p>Assessment is based on additional walking distance which must be negotiated by passengers longer journey. Access to the new platform requires no bridge crossing but given that DART services will also use platform 2/3 that does require a bridge crossing this will negate any accessibility benefits as passengers would use platform 2/3.</p>	
		21	<p>Single Navan Branch Platform with southern headshunt to depot.</p>	<p>The construction of a single platform on the Navan branch will result in DART service platform 3 and the new platform. This will result in uncertainty in platform destinations for passengers, furthermore this option introduces extended travel distances for passengers transferring services</p>		<p>Assessment is based on additional walking distance which must be negotiated by passengers longer journey. Access to the new platform requires no bridge crossing but given that DART services will also use platform 2/3 that does require a bridge crossing this will negate any accessibility benefits as passengers would use platform 2/3.</p>	
		22	<p>Island Navan Branch Platform with no ECX moves to Navan Platform.</p>	<p>The construction of two new platform faces would allow the majority of DART services to use the Navan branch platform, allowing passengers largely to have a single point for DART services. This option introduces increased travel distances for passengers transferring services</p>		<p>Assessment is based on additional walking distance or crossings allowing for provision of lifts which must be negotiated by passengers relative to their destination. 25 involves bridge crossing and longer journey, including connection to Drogheda services.</p>	
		23	<p>Island Navan Branch Platform with southern headshunt to depot.</p>	<p>The construction of two new platform faces would allow the majority of DART services to use the Navan branch platform, allowing passengers largely to have a single point for DART services. This option introduces increased travel distances for passengers transferring services</p>		<p>Assessment is based on additional walking distance or crossings allowing for provision of lifts which must be negotiated by passengers relative to their destination. 27 involves bridge crossing and longer journey, including connection to Drogheda services.</p>	

Comparison Criteria Legend	
Green	Compliance with all criteria
Yellow	Compliance with most criteria
Orange	Compliance with some criteria
Red	Compliance with few criteria
Dark Red	Compliance with no criteria

Technical Annex	Summary of requirements	Option Number	Description of Option	Integration										Physical Activity	
				Adaptability in the future		Transport Integration		Land use integration		Geographical Integration		Government policy integration		Walking / cycling opportunities	
				Qualitative appraisal of the options and their impact on future transport plans	Rationale	Qualitative appraisal of the options and their impact on integration with other transport modes	Rationale	Qualitative appraisal of the options and their impact on integration with land use and policies	Rationale	Qualitative appraisal of the options and their impact on integration with geographical policies	Rationale	Qualitative appraisal of the options and their impact on integration with government policies	Rationale		
				Ability to continue to function successfully despite future changes in circumstances	Scope for and ease of interchange between modes Reduce interchange nodes and facilities Reduce waiting and wait times associated with interchange Integration with the cycle network Modal shift: Agree during construction and operation Change to journey times to transport nodes Impact on the operation of the other transport services both during construction and in operation stage			Coincidence with land use strategies, regional and local plans		Potential to impact on external links during construction Potential to impact on external links during operation Consideration for any community severance impacts		Integration with national and international plans and policies		To enable walking and cycling opportunities in a safer environment in the communities along the route To create a healthy environment conducive to active travel Connectivity to adjoining cycling and pedestrian facilities Enhanced connectivity between key attractions/trip generators related to active modes Overhead, duration and impact on journey times and potential to create a negative modal shift (e.g. people not to drive instead of walk or cycle)	
Works Around Dunstable Mainline Station	Provide new turnback infrastructure which will move the Train Service Specification To allow for continued movements of freight traffic to and from the Newn Branch. Provide additional DART rolling stock stabling within the Dinghies area as per the DART+ stabling strategy	10	New platform at location of existing service stand 4 with new crossover allowing standard trains from down end to meet at the station approach with no ECN moves to disrupt it peak		No impact on future transport plans	No impact on other transport modes		The proposal complies with regional and local policies to improve public transport services including DART services, encouraging modal shift and allowing for increased density of development in certain areas. There is no impact on existing land uses.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		No impact on walking/cycling opportunities	
		11	New platform at location of existing service stand 4 with new depot headshunt to South end with new crossover from down train at the station approach		No impact on future transport plans	No impact on other transport modes		The proposal complies with regional and local policies to improve public transport services including DART services, encouraging modal shift and allowing for increased density of development in certain areas. There is no impact on existing land uses.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		No impact on walking/cycling opportunities	
		12	New platform at location of existing service stand 4 with new depot headshunt to South end with new crossover from down train at the station approach. Southern headshunt depot outside only		No impact on future transport plans	No impact on other transport modes		The proposal complies with regional and local policies to improve public transport services including DART services, encouraging modal shift and allowing for increased density of development in certain areas. The development is contained within the existing envelope of the full line. There is no impact on existing land uses.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		No impact on walking/cycling opportunities	
		20	Single Newn Branch Platform but with no ECN moves to Newn platform		No impact on future transport plans	No impact on other transport modes		The proposal complies with regional and local policies to improve public transport services including DART services, encouraging modal shift and allowing for increased density of development in certain areas. There is no impact on existing land uses.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		No impact on walking/cycling opportunities	
		21	Single Newn Branch Platform with southern headshunt to depot		No impact on future transport plans	No impact on other transport modes		The proposal complies with regional and local policies to improve public transport services including DART services, encouraging modal shift and allowing for increased density of development in certain areas. The development is contained within the existing envelope of the full line. There is no impact on existing land uses.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		No impact on walking/cycling opportunities	
		22	Island Newn Branch Platform with no ECN moves to Newn platform		No impact on future transport plans	No impact on other transport modes		The proposal complies with regional and local policies to improve public transport services including DART services, encouraging modal shift and allowing for increased density of development in certain areas. There is no impact on existing land uses.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		No impact on walking/cycling opportunities	
		23	Island Newn Branch Platform with southern headshunt to depot		No impact on future transport plans	No impact on other transport modes		The proposal complies with regional and local policies to improve public transport services including DART services, encouraging modal shift and allowing for increased density of development in certain areas. There is no impact on existing land uses.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		All international, national, regional and local policies encourage improvements in relation to the efficiency of public transport. All the proposed options will facilitate this.		No impact on walking/cycling opportunities	